



# Intervention and Reflection

---

BASIC ISSUES IN MEDICAL ETHICS

SIXTH EDITION

Ronald Munson

# Contents

## Preface xiv

## MORAL PRINCIPLES, ETHICAL THEORIES, AND MEDICAL DECISIONS: AN INTRODUCTION 1

### I. BASIC ETHICAL THEORIES 3

Utilitarianism 4

Kant's Ethics 12

Ross's Ethics 17

Rawls's Theory of Justice 21

Natural Law Ethics and Moral Theology 26

### II. MAJOR MORAL PRINCIPLES 31

The Principle of Nonmaleficence 32

The Principle of Beneficence 34

The Principle of Utility 36

Principles of Distributive Justice 37

The Principle of Autonomy 40

### III. THEORIES WITHOUT PRINCIPLES 45

Virtue Ethics 46

Care Ethics 48

Feminist Ethics 52

### IV. RETROSPECT 55

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 55

## PART I TERMINATION 59

### Chapter 1 ABORTION 60

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Present Picture—General  
Ambivalence 61

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The "Partial-Birth Abortion"  
Controversy 64

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Crucial Legal and Policy  
Decisions 67

CASE PRESENTATION: The Ordeal of Alice  
Wilson 71

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Conflict over RU-486,  
"The Abortion Pill" 72

CASE RETROSPECTIVE: When Abortion Was  
Illegal: Mrs. Sherri Finkbine and the  
Thalidomide Tragedy 75

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Emergency Contraception:  
"The Morning-After Pill" 76

## INTRODUCTION 76

Human Development and Abortion 77

The Status of the Fetus 78

Pregnancy, Abortion, and the Rights of  
Women 79

Therapeutic Abortion 80

Abortion and the Law 81

Ethical Theories and Abortion 82

## READINGS 83

Section 1: The Status of the Fetus 83

John T. Noonan Jr.: *An Almost Absolute Value  
in History* 83

Judith Jarvis Thomson: *A Defense of Abortion* 87

Mary Anne Warren: *On the Moral and Legal  
Status of Abortion* 96

Don Marquis: *Why Abortion Is Immoral* 105

U.S. Supreme Court: *U.S. Supreme Court  
Decision in Roe v. Wade* 109

## Section 2: Feminist Perspectives 113

Susan Sherwin: *Abortion Through a Feminist Ethic Lens* 113

Sidney Callahan: *A Case for Pro-life Feminism* 116

## Section 3: Late-Term Abortion 122

Joan Carpenter: *"Partial-Birth" Abortion: Let's Be Reasonable* 122

## DECISION SCENARIOS 126

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 132

## Chapter 2 IMPAIRED INFANTS AND MEDICAL FUTILITY 135

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Dilemma of Extreme Prematurity 136

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Baby Doe Cases 139

CASE PRESENTATION: Baby K: An Anencephalic Infant and a Mother's Request 142

CASE PRESENTATION: Baby Owens: Down Syndrome and Duodenal Atresia 143

## INTRODUCTION 145

Genetic and Congenital Impairments 145

Specific Impairments 146

Testing for Impairments 148

Ethical Theories and the Problem of Birth Impairments 149

## READINGS 151

## Section 1: The Status of Impaired Infants 151

John A. Robertson: *Examination of Arguments in Favor of Withholding Ordinary Medical Care from Defective Infants* 151

H. Tristram Engelhardt Jr.: *Ethical Issues in Aiding the Death of Young Children* 158

Robert F. Weir: *Life-and-Death Decisions in the Midst of Uncertainty* 163

## Section 2: Medical Futility 170

Nancy S. Jecker and Roberta A. Pagon: *Medical Futility* 170

Norman C. Fost: *Medical Futility: Commentary* 175

## DECISION SCENARIOS 180

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 187

## Chapter 3 EUTHANASIA AND PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE 189

CASE PRESENTATION: Karen Quinlan: The Debate Begins 190

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Oregon's Physician-Assisted Suicide Law, First in the Nation 192

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The *Cruzan* Case: In a Landmark Decision, the Supreme Court Upholds the Right to Die 196

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Dr. Jack Kevorkian: Physician-Assisted Suicide Activist 199

CASE PRESENTATION: Elizabeth Bouvia's Demand to Starve—with Assistance 201

CASE PRESENTATION: A Canadian Tragedy 202

## INTRODUCTION 203

Active and Passive Euthanasia 203

Voluntary, Involuntary, and Nonvoluntary Euthanasia 204

Defining "Death" 205

The Dutch Experience 207

Advance Directives 208

Ethical Theories and Euthanasia 210

## READINGS 212

Section 1: The Case for Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide 212

James Rachels: *Active and Passive Euthanasia* 212

Dan W. Brock: *Voluntary Active Euthanasia* 215

Section 2: The Case Against Euthanasia and Physician-Assisted Suicide 222

J. Gay-Williams: *The Wrongfulness of Euthanasia* 222

Daniel Callahan: *When Self-Determination Runs Amok*\* 225

Section 3: Deciding for the Incompetent 230  
Supreme Court of New Jersey: *In the Matter of Karen Quinlan, an Alleged Incompetent* 230  
Rebecca S. Dresser and John A. Robertson: *Quality of Life and Non-treatment Decisions for Incompetent Patients: A Critique of the Orthodox Approach* 233

Section 4: Alternatives 238  
Bernard Gert, James L. Bernat, and R. Peter Mogielnicki: *Distinguishing Between Patients' Refusals and Requests* 238  
Sandol Stoddard: *Terminal, but Not Hopeless* 241

DECISION SCENARIOS 242

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 248

## PART II RIGHTS 253

### Chapter 4 RACE, GENDER, AND MEDICINE 254

---

CASE PRESENTATION: Bad Blood, Bad Faith: The Tuskegee Syphilis Study 255

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Mammography Debate 258

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Prostate Cancer Epidemic 262

CASE PRESENTATION: Cultures in Conflict 265

INTRODUCTION 266

African Americans and Health Care 267

Native Americans and Alaska Natives and Health Care 273

Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders and Health Care 275

Hispanic Americans/Latinos and Health Care 277

Women and Health Care 278

Conclusion 282

READINGS 284

Section 1: Perspectives on Gender and Race 284  
Susan Sherwin: *Gender, Race, and Class in the Delivery of Health Care* 284

Annette Dula: *Toward an African-American Perspective on Bioethics* 289

Section 2: Conducting Research 296  
Sara Goering: *Women and Underserved Populations: Access to Clinical Trials* 296

Patricia A. King: *The Dangers of Difference: The Legacy of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study* 300

Section 3: Setting Public Policy 303  
H. Jack Geiger: *The Demise of Affirmative Action and the Future of Health Care* 303  
Kenneth De Ville: *Parties to the Social Contract? Justice and Health Care for Undocumented Immigrants* 306

DECISION SCENARIOS 311

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 314

### Chapter 5 HIV AND AIDS: STILL A PROBLEM 319

---

CASE PRESENTATION: Will Teresa Blair Take Her Medicine? 320

CASE PRESENTATION: Being HIV-Positive as a Disability 321

SOCIAL CONTEXT: AIDS Activism and the Democratization of Biomedicine 322

CASE PRESENTATION: The Way It Was: Tod Thompson, Dallas, 1993-1994 325

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Mandatory AIDS Testing and Pregnancy: The Old and the New 327

CASE PRESENTATION: The Mysterious Infection of Kimberly Bergalis 329

INTRODUCTION 331

Combination Therapy: AIDS on the Run 332

Discovering the Disease 336

Ethical and Social Issues 343

## READINGS 349

## Section 1: Responsibility, Confidentiality, and HIV/AIDS 349

Alan J. Mayer: *The Irresponsibility That Spreads AIDS* 349

Martin L. Smith and Kevin P. Martin: *Confidentiality in the Age of AIDS: A Case Study in Clinical Ethics* 350

Ronald Bayer: *AIDS Prevention and Cultural Sensitivity: Are They Compatible?* 356

## Section 2: Testing for HIV 360

Bob Hunter and Jay Angoff: *Insurers Are Right on AIDS Testing* 360

William C. Gifford III: *An Insidious Test for AIDS* 361

## Section 3: HIV/AIDS Policy Issues 362

Eric Slater: *AIDS Exceptionalism Is No Longer Justifiable* 362

Daniel Saturn: *Controlling AIDS/HIV Forever: Guidelines for Using Protease Inhibitors* 367

## DECISION SCENARIOS 370

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 374

---

**Chapter 6 PHYSICIANS, PATIENTS, AND OTHERS: AUTONOMY, TRUTH TELLING, AND CONFIDENTIALITY 377**


---

CASE PRESENTATION: Donald (Dax) Cowart Rejects Treatment—And Is Ignored 378

CASE PRESENTATION: Children at Risk: Was There a Duty to Violate Confidentiality? 381

CASE PRESENTATION: Medical ID Cards and Privacy 383

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Pregnancy and Responsibility 384

CASE PRESENTATION: The Death of Robyn Twitchell and Christian Science 387

## INTRODUCTION 389

Autonomy 389

Paternalism 390

Informed Consent and Medical Treatment 393

Truth Telling in Medicine 395

Dignity and Consent 397

Confidentiality (Privacy) 398

Ethical Theories: Autonomy, Truth Telling, and Confidentiality 399

## READINGS 402

## Section 1: Consent to Medical Treatment 402

Gerald Dworkin: *Paternalism* 402

Dax Cowart and Robert Burt: *Confronting Death: Who Chooses, Who Controls? A Dialogue* 411

James F. Drane: *Competency to Give an Informed Consent: A Model for Making Clinical Assessments* 415

Howard Brody: *Transparency: Informed Consent in Primary Care* 419

## Section 2: Autonomy and Pregnancy 424

Alexander Morgan Capron: *Punishing Mothers* 424

John A. Robertson and Joseph D. Schulman: *Pregnancy and Prenatal Harm to Offspring* 428

## Section 3: Truth Telling 434

Mack Lipkin: *On Telling Patients the Truth* 434

Susan Cullen and Margaret Klein: *Respect for Patients, Physicians, and the Truth* 435

## Section 4: Confidentiality 442

Mark Siegler: *Confidentiality in Medicine—A Decrepit Concept* 442

Supreme Court of California: *Decision in the Tarasoff Case* 445

## DECISION SCENARIOS 451

## ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 459

---

**Chapter 7 RESEARCH ETHICS AND INFORMED CONSENT 462**


---

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Clinical Trials, HIV, and Pregnancy: A Third-World Tuskegee? 463

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Cold-War Radiation Experiments 466

CASE PRESENTATION: The Willowbrook Hepatitis Experiments 469

CASE PRESENTATION: Echoes of Willowbrook or Tuskegee? Experimenting with Children 470

CASE PRESENTATION: Baby Fae 471

CASE PRESENTATION: The Use of Morally Tainted Sources: The *Pernkopf Anatomy* 473

INTRODUCTION 473

Drug Testing 475

The "Informed" Part of Informed Consent 476

The "Consent" Part of Informed Consent 477

Vulnerable Populations 477

Medical Research and Medical Therapy 478

Placebos and Research 478

Therapeutic and Nontherapeutic Research 479

Research Involving Children 480

Research Involving Prisoners 483

Research Involving the Poor 484

Research Involving the Terminally Ill 485

Research Involving Fetuses 486

Research Involving Animals 488

Women and Medical Research 490

Summary 490

Ethical Theories: Medical Research and Informed Consent 492

READINGS 494

Section 1: Consent and Experimentation 494

Nancy E. Kass, Jeremy Sugarman, Ruth Faden, and Monica Schoch-Spana: *Trust: The Fragile Foundation of Contemporary Biomedical Research* 494

Hans Jonas: *Philosophical Reflections on Experimenting with Human Subjects* 499

Stephen Goldby, Saul Krugman, M. H. Pappworth, and Geoffrey Edsall: *The Willowbrook Letters: Criticism and Defense* 508

Paul Ramsey: *Judgment on Willowbrook* 511

*Principles of the Nuremberg Code* 515

Section 2: The Ethics of Randomized Clinical Trials 516

Samuel Hellman and Deborah S. Hellman: *Of Mice but Not Men: Problems of the Randomized Clinical Trial* 516

Eugene Passamani: *Clinical Trials: Are They Ethical?* 520

Section 3: Relativism and Retrospective Judgments 524

Allen Buchanan: *Judging the Past: The Case of the Human Radiation Experiments* 524

Section 4: Animal Experimentation 531

Peter Singer: *Animal Experimentation* 531

Carl Cohen: *The Case for the Use of Animals in Biomedical Research* 538

DECISION SCENARIOS 544

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 553

PART III CONTROLS 557

Chapter 8 GENETICS: INTERVENTION, CONTROL, AND RESEARCH 558

SOCIAL CONTEXT: The Holy Grail of Biology: The Human Genome Project 559

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Genetic Testing and Screening 562

CASE PRESENTATION: Gene Therapy 566

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Human Stem Cells—Amazing Treatments of the Future? 569

CASE PRESENTATION: Huntington's Disease: Genetic Testing and Ethical Dilemmas 571

INTRODUCTION 574

Genetic Intervention: Screening, Counseling, and Diagnosis 575

Genetic Disease 575

Genetic Screening 577

- Genetic Counseling 580
- Prenatal Genetic Diagnosis 580
  - Difficulties with Genetic Intervention 583
- Eugenics 585
  - Negative and Positive Eugenics 586
  - Use of Desirable Germ Cells 587
  - Difficulties with Eugenics 588
- Genetic Research, Therapy, and Technology 589
  - Recombinant DNA 589
  - Gene Therapy 591
  - Biohazards 591
  - Difficulties with Genetic Research, Therapy, and Technology 592

## READINGS

- Section 1: Genetic Testing 594
  - Ruth Hubbard and R. C. Lewontin: *Pitfalls of Genetic Testing* 594
  - Robert Wachbroit: *Disowning Knowledge: Issues in Genetic Testing* 597
- Section 2: Genetic Counseling 601
  - Dena S. Davis: *Genetic Dilemmas and the Child's Right to an Open Future* 601
- Section 3: Genetic Testing and Reproductive Decisions 611
  - Laura M. Purdy: *Genetics and Reproductive Risk: Can Having Children Be Immoral?* 611
  - Leon R. Kass: *Implications of Prenatal Diagnosis for the Human Right to Life* 617
- Section 4: Gene Therapy 624
  - Ronald Munson and Lawrence H. Davis: *Germ-Line Therapy and the Medical Imperative* 624

DECISION SCENARIOS 633

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 638

## Chapter 9 REPRODUCTIVE CONTROL: ASSISTED REPRODUCTION AND ETHICS 646

SOCIAL CONTEXT: Hello, Dolly: The Advent of Cloning 647

- CASE PRESENTATION: Louise Brown, the First "Test-Tube Baby" 650
- CASE PRESENTATION: Septuplets: The Perils of Multiple Pregnancies 651
- SOCIAL CONTEXT: Postmenopausal Motherhood 653
- CASE PRESENTATION: Embryos in Court: The *Davis* and *Nahmani* Cases 654
- SOCIAL CONTEXT: Father Shopping: Sperm by Mail 656
- CASE PRESENTATION: Baby M and Mary Beth Whitehead: Surrogate Pregnancy in Court 656
- CASE PRESENTATION: The Calvert Case: A Gestational Surrogate Changes Her Mind 658

INTRODUCTION 659

- IVF, GIFT, ZIFT, and Other Techniques 660
- Need, Success Rates, and Costs of Assisted Reproduction 662
- Multiple Births 662
- Freezing Embryos 663
- Gestational Surrogates and Donor Ova 664
- Criticisms of Assisted-Reproduction Practices 664
- Benefits of IVF and Other Forms of Assisted Reproduction 665
- Ethical and Social Difficulties 666
- Cloning and Twinning 667
- Artificial Insemination 668
- Ova Donors 671
- Surrogate Pregnancy 671
- Ethical Theories and Reproductive Control 673

READINGS 674

- Section 1: Assisted Reproduction 674
  - Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith: *Instruction on Respect for Human Life in Its Origin and on the Dignity of Procreation: Replies to Certain Questions of the Day* 674
  - Gillian Hanscombe: *The Right to Lesbian Parenthood* 681

Cynthia B. Cohen: "Give Me Children or I Shall Die!" *New Reproductive Technologies and Harm to Children* 684

## Section 2: Surrogate Pregnancy 695

Bonnie Steinbock: *Surrogate Motherhood as Prenatal Adoption* 695

Elizabeth S. Anderson: *Is Women's Labor a Commodity?* 702

## Section 3: Human Cloning 710

Leon R. Kass: *The Wisdom of Repugnance* 710

National Bioethics Advisory Commission: *Cloning Human Beings: Ethical Considerations* 715

Susan Jacoby: *Entitled to the Embryo?* 724

DECISION SCENARIOS 725

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 730

## PART IV RESOURCES 735

### Chapter 10 ACQUIRING AND ALLOCATING SCARCE MEDICAL RESOURCES 736

SOCIAL CONTEXT: *Acquiring and Allocating Transplant Organs* 737

CASE PRESENTATION: *Sandra Jensen Gets a Transplant* 743

CASE PRESENTATION: *The Ayalas' Solution to a Shortage: Having a Child to Save a Life* 744

SOCIAL CONTEXT: *Fetal-Cell Implants* 745

CASE PRESENTATION: *The Drug Lottery: The Betaseron Shortage* 748

CASE PRESENTATION: *Selection Committee for Dialysis* 749

INTRODUCTION 753

Transplants, Kidneys, and Machines 753

Controlling Rejection 753

Allocating and Scarcity 754

Seattle and Kidney Machines 754

Dialysis Costs and Decisions 755

Microallocation Versus Macroallocation 756

Ethical Theories and the Allocation of Medical Resources 757

READINGS 758

## Section 1: Allocation Principles 758

Nicholas Rescher: *The Allocation of Exotic Medical Lifesaving Therapy* 758

Leonard Fleck: *Just Caring: Managed Care and Protease Inhibitors* 767

## Section 2: Acquiring Transplant Organs 773

Carl Cohen: *The Case for Presumed Consent to Transplant Human Organs After Death* 773

Michael Kinsley: *Take My Kidney, Please* 779

Leon R. Kass: *Organs for Sale? Propriety, Property, and the Price of Progress* 781

## Section 3: Allocating Transplant Organs 785

George J. Annas: *The Prostitute, the Playboy, and the Poet: Rationing Schemes for Organ Transplantation* 785

Carl Cohen, Martin Benjamin, et al.: *Alcoholics and Liver Transplantation* 789

DECISION SCENARIOS 794

ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 800

### Chapter 11 THE CLAIM TO HEALTH CARE 804

SOCIAL CONTEXT: *The Crisis Isn't Over* 805

SOCIAL CONTEXT: *A Patients' Bill of Rights: Protecting Patients from Managed Care* 813

CASE PRESENTATION: *The Canadian System: Troubled but Still a Model?* 817

CASE PRESENTATION: *Drawing the Line in Oregon: Rationing Health Care* 822

CASE PRESENTATION: *Employer-Mandated Health Insurance: The Hawaiian Example* 825

INTRODUCTION 827

Claim-Rights, Legal Rights, and Statutory Rights 827

Moral Rights 828

Political Rights 828

**READINGS 830****Section 1: Justice and Health Care 830**

President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine: *An Ethical Framework for Access to Health Care* 830

Daniel Callahan: *Aging and the Ends of Medicine* 838

**Section 2: Managed Care and Rationing 844**

Marcia Angell: *The Doctor as Double Agent* 844

Uwe E. Reinhardt: *Wanted: A Clearly Articulated Social Ethic for American Health Care* 849

**Section 3: Alternatives to the Present System 852**

Jim McDermott: *The Case for a Single-Payer Approach* 852

Victor Dirnfeld: *The Benefits of Privatization* 857

**DECISION SCENARIOS 860****ADDITIONAL RESOURCES 864****Notes and References for Introductions, Cases, and Scenarios 869****General Resources in Bioethics 887**