GENE FLOW FROM GM PLANTS

Edited by

Guy M. Poppy and Michael J. Wilkinson

Blackwell
Publishing

Contents

List of Contributors xi
Preface xiii

1 Where science fits into the GM debate 1
PHILIP J. DALE

1.1 Background 1
1.2 Regulation 1
1.3 Stimulus for research 2
1.4 Vigorous campaigning 3
1.5 The GM Nation Public Debate 4
1.6 Gene flow issues raised in the public debate 5
1.6.1 GM is unnatural 5
1.6.2 Genetic contamination 5
1.6.3 GM and organic agriculture cannot coexist 6
1.6.4 GM crops will damage the environment 7
1.7 Findings of the debate 7
1.8 Discussion 7
1.8.1 GM crops have become 'a lightning rod' for a range of concerns 8
1.8.2 Difficulty of holding a rational discussion of GM crops in context 8
1.8.2.1 Method not mission 8
1.8.2.2 The FSEs raised wider issues 9
1.8.3 Broader agricultural issues 10
1.8.4 Political context 10
References 11

2 Crop biotechnology – the state of play 12
THOMAS E. NICKSON

2.1 Introduction 12
2.2 A need for better tools in crop production systems 14
2.2.1 Crop production and sustainability 14
2.3 The current state of GM crops 18
2.3.1 Herbicide tolerance 21
2.3.2 Insect protection 23
2.3.3 Virus resistance in plants 26

2.4 Future developments 27
2.4.1 Expansion of Bt and HT 28
2.4.2 Other pest resistance traits 29
2.4.3 Tolerance to abiotic stress 30
2.4.4 Output traits 30
2.4.5 Other GM plants 32
2.4.6 Gene flow containment 33
2.5 Summary 35
Acknowledgements 36
References 37

3 Pollen dispersal vectored by wind or insects 43
GAVIN RAMSAY

3.1 Introduction 43
3.1.1 The fascination with pollination 43
3.1.2 The pollination of crop plants 44
3.1.3 Pollen dispersal, gene flow and GM crops 47
3.2 Evolutionary and ecological aspects of pollination biology 47
3.2.1 Evolutionary aspects of wind-mediated pollination 47
3.2.2 Adaptations for wind pollination 49
3.2.3 Airborne pollen recording for allergy sufferers 50
3.2.4 Evolutionary and ecological aspects of entomophily 51
3.2.5 Adaptations for entomophily 53
3.3 Managing insect pollination for crop production 54
3.3.1 Crops benefiting from wild and managed pollinators 54
3.3.2 The use of managed pollinators 54
3.4 Experiments and observations on vectors in oilseed rape, beet and maize 56
3.4.1 Uncertainties on the relative importance of different vectors in oilseed rape 56
3.4.2 Oilseed rape cross-pollination: observations 57
3.4.3 Oilseed rape cross pollination: experimental data 59
3.4.4 Other crops 59
3.5 Processes and patterns with wind-mediated pollination 61
3.5.1 Deposition, turbulence and impaction 61
3.5.2 Long-distance dispersal 62
3.5.3 Local barriers, directionality and edge effects 63
3.6 Processes and patterns with insect-mediated pollination 63
3.6.1 Functional groupings of pollinators 63
3.6.2 Common processes: local dispersal 64
3.6.3 Processes and patterns for social insects 64
3.6.4 Edge effects in recipient patches 67
3.6.5 Patchiness and pollinator behaviour 68
3.6.6 Influence of landscape patterns on pollen dispersal 69
3.7 Modelling pollen dispersal based on vectors 69
3.7.1 General models 69
3.7.2 Modelling elements of bee behaviour 70

3.8 Lessons for the management of gene flow from studies on vectors 71
3.8.1 Effectiveness of isolation by distance 71
3.8.2 Managing seed and crop production systems 71
References 73

4 Hybridisation – reproductive barriers to gene flow 78
A.J. RICHARDS

4.1 The taxonomic context of hybrid formation 78
4.1.1 What is a (crop) species? 80
4.2 Reproductive isolation 82
4.2.1 Potential for hybridisation 82
4.2.2 Wallace Effect 83
4.2.3 Pre-pollination isolation 84
4.2.3.1 Distance 85
4.2.3.2 Temporal isolation (phenology) 86
4.2.3.3 Ethological (pollinator) preference 87
4.2.4 Post-pollination, prezygotic isolation (interspecific incompatibility) 88
4.2.4.1 Unilateral incompatibility 89
4.2.5 Post-zygotic isolation 90
4.2.5.1 Embryo–endosperm balance seed incompatibility 91
4.2.5.2 Genomic imprinting 92
4.2.5.3 Seed sterility (F_1 embryo inviability) 93
4.2.6 F_1 hybrid sterility 94
4.2.6.1 Invasive sterile hybrids 94
4.2.6.2 The causes of hybrid sterility: chromosome homology 95
4.2.6.3 The causes of hybrid sterility: irregular polyploidy 97
4.3 Hybridisation, introgression and consequences of transgene spread 100
4.3.1 Hybrid swarms 100
4.3.2 Hybrid habitats 102
4.3.3 Introgression 103
4.3.4 Hybridisation and extinction 105
4.4 Concluding remarks 107
References 109

5 Rare hybrids and methods for their detection 113
RIKKE BAGGER JØRGENSEN AND MICHAEL J. WILKINSON

5.1 Introduction 113
5.2 Gene flow – to what extent will it take place? 114
5.2.1 Barriers to gene flow 114
5.3 Plants have different potential for dispersal of genes 115
5.3.1 Species groups 115
5.4 The hybridisation potential of major European crops 117
5.4.1 Wheat, *Triticum aestivum* (17 300 000 ha) 117
5.4.2 Barley, *Hordeum vulgare* (10 600 000 ha) 119

5.4.3 Maize, *Zea mays* (4 350 000 ha) 120
5.4.4 Pumpkins for fodder, *Cucurbita pepo* (5 100 000 ha) 121
5.4.5 Olives, *Olea europaea* (4 300 000 ha) 121
5.4.6 Oilseed rape, *Brassica napus* (3 500 000 ha) 122
5.4.7 Vine, *Vitis vinifera* (3 500 000 ha) 123
5.4.8 Sunflower seeds, *Helianthus annuus* (2 200 000 ha) 124
5.4.9 Sugar beet, *Beta vulgaris* ssp. *vulgaris* (2 000 000 ha) 124
5.4.10 Oat, *Avena sativa* (1 900 000 ha) 125
5.5 Methods for detection and quantification of rare hybrids 125
5.6 Preliminary screens for hybrids 127
5.6.1 Morphology 127
5.6.2 Sterility 128
5.6.3 Herbicide bioassays and visible marker genes 128
5.6.4 Protein assays 129
5.6.5 Chromosome analysis and flow cytometry 129
5.6.6 Microarrays 130
5.7 Confirmation of hybrid status 130
5.7.1 Isozymes 130
5.7.2 DNA-based methods 131
5.7.2.1 PCR-based techniques 131
5.7.2.2 Random amplified polymorphic DNA 132
5.7.2.3 Amplified fragment length polymorphism 132
5.7.2.4 Simple sequence repeats (microsatellites) 132
5.7.2.5 Quantitative PCR (real-time PCR) 133
5.8 Introgression 133
5.8.1 Data analysis for introgression 134
5.8.2 AFLPOP 134
5.8.3 New Hybrids 134
5.8.4 Structure 134
5.9 Conclusions 135
References 135

6 Assessing the ecological fitness of recipients 143
ARTHUR E. WEIS

6.1 Introduction 143
6.2 Hybridization, introgression and internal selection 145
6.2.1 The biology of natural hybrids and hybrid zones 145
6.2.2 Crop–wild hybridization: two examples 149
6.2.2.1 Sunflower 149
6.2.2.2 Oilseed rape 150
6.3 Projecting introgression of transgenes using empirical data and models 154
6.3.1 How well do fitness estimates predict population change? 156
6.3.2 A way around the difficulties? 159
6.4 Conclusion: a reason for hope, a cause for concern 163
Acknowledgements 164
References 164

7 Assessing the environmental risks of gene flow from GM crops to wild relatives **169**
ALAN RAYBOULD AND MICHAEL J. WILKINSON

7.1 Introduction 169
7.2 What is risk assessment? 169
7.3 Tiered testing and risk assessment 171
7.4 General requirements for assessing risks of gene flow from transgenic crops 172
7.5 Assessment endpoints 173
7.6 Hazard assessments 174
7.6.1 Toxicity of transgene product 174
7.6.2 Enhanced invasiveness of transgene recipient 174
7.6.3 Transgene-induced changes to community of the recipient 178
7.7 Exposure assessments 181
7.8 Proposed scheme for assessing the environmental risks of gene flow 182
References 184

8 Quantifying exposure **186**
JAMIE P. SUTHERLAND AND GUY M. POPPY

8.1 Introduction 186
8.2 Defining risk, hazard and exposure 187
8.3 Exposure trees 189
8.4 An introduction to tiered risk assessment 190
8.5 Quantifying exposure with first- and second-tier experimentation 192
8.5.1 Exposure in non-target herbivores and pollinators 192
8.5.2 Exposure in natural enemies 193
8.5.3 Exposure in soil organisms 195
8.6 Quantifying exposure with third-tier experimentation 195
8.6.1 Exposure in herbivores and pollinators 196
8.6.2 Exposure in natural enemies 198
8.6.3 Exposure in soil organisms 198
8.7 Planned releases of GM crops 199
8.8 Alternative approaches to quantifying exposure 201
8.8.1 Simulation studies 201
8.8.1.1 Advantages of transgene simulation 202
8.8.1.2 Disadvantages of transgene simulation 202
8.8.1.3 Future scope of transgene simulation 204
8.8.2 Modelling 204
8.9 Conclusions 207
Acknowledgements 207
References 208

9 Regulating the risks of gene flow **213**
STEVEN HILL

9.1 Introduction 213
9.2 The European Regulatory Framework for GM crops 214

9.2.1 Ensuring consumer safety: Directive 2001/18/EC and Regulation 1829/2003/EC on GM food and feed 214
9.2.2 Ensuring consumer choice: Regulation 1830/2003/EC on traceability, labelling and coexistence measures 215
9.2.3 The international context 217
9.3 Risk assessment of gene flow 218
9.3.1 How well is the rate of gene transfer known? 219
9.3.2 How well are the consequences of gene flow known? 221
9.4 Conclusions 223
References 223

10 Risk assessment of GM crops – does the road ahead need to be long and winding? 225
GUY M. POPPY AND MICHAEL J. WILKINSON

10.1 Setting the scene 225
10.2 Managing the land for multiple users 225
10.3 Global strategies for risk assessment 227
10.4 Relative importance of environmental changes arising from GM crops 229
10.5 History of GM risk assessment 232
10.6 Hazard-led research 233
10.7 Regulation-led research 233
10.8 The way forward 234
References 237

Index 239