

# Water-Quality Trading

## A Guide for the Wastewater Community

- Evaluate the needs of your facility
- Design and implementation guidelines
- Tools to assess local needs
- Regulatory compliance

CY JONES, LISA BACON, MARK S. KIESER,  
AND DAVID SHERIDAN

# Contents

Foreword .....	.xvii
Preface .....	.xxi
About the Authors .....	.xxiii
About the Reviewers .....	.xxvii

## Chapter One: An Introduction to Water-Quality Trading—*Cy Jones*

Introduction .....	.2
What Is Water-Quality Trading? .....	.3
The Sulfur Dioxide Allowance Market .....	.4
A Brief History of Trading from the Wastewater Perspective .....	.6
Purpose and Structure of the Book .....	.9
References .....	.11

## Chapter Two: General Conceptual Models for Water-Quality Trading—*Cy Jones*

Introduction .....	.14
Managed Trading .....	.14
<i>Connecticut Long Island Sound Nitrogen Trading Program</i> .....	.15

## *Water-Quality Trading: A Guide for the Wastewater Community*

Trading Associations .....	18
<i>Tar-Pamlico Trading Association</i> .....	19
<i>Neuse River Compliance Association</i> .....	21
Marketlike Trading .....	21
The Michigan Rules .....	23
<i>Lower Boise River Phosphorus Trading Program</i> .....	25
Conclusions .....	26
Small-Scale Offset Programs .....	27
<i>Rahr Malting Company</i> .....	27
<i>Wayland Business Center</i> .....	29
Conclusion .....	30
References .....	31

## **Chapter Three: Water Quality and Wastewater Treatment Plants—*Cy Jones***

Introduction .....	35
Water-Quality Standards .....	36
Designated Uses .....	36
Water-Quality Criteria .....	37
Issues with Water-Quality Standards .....	39
Designated Uses .....	39
Numeric Water-Quality Criteria .....	42
Narrative Water-Quality Criteria .....	44
Antidegradation .....	46
Derivation of Effluent Limits from Water-Quality Standards .....	48
Antibacksliding .....	51
Clean Water Act Section 303(d)—Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	52
Identification and Listing of Impaired Waters .....	53
Data Needs .....	54

Measuring Impairment .....	56
Structure of the Impaired Waters List .....	57
Development of Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	58
Statement of the Water-Quality Problem .....	59
Analysis to Determine the Allowable Load .....	59
Allocations .....	61
Public Review .....	62
Review and Approval .....	62
Implementation .....	63
Phased Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	65
Informational Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	66
Issues and Concerns with Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	67
Lack of Historical Success .....	67
Resource Needs .....	67
Scientific Uncertainty .....	68
Nonpoint-Source Pollution .....	68
Allocation Methods .....	70
Equity .....	71
Adaptive Implementation .....	71
Trading and Water-Quality Management and Planning .....	73
Authority to Trade .....	73
Water-Quality Planning .....	75
Water-Quality Standards .....	77
Antidegradation .....	77
Antibacksliding .....	79
Total Maximum Daily Loads .....	80
Other Analytical Frameworks .....	81
Geographic Trading Areas .....	81
National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits .....	83
Tradable Pollutants .....	83
Types of Trading .....	85
Watershed Scenarios .....	87

The Receiving Water Body Is Unimpaired or Has Not Been Assessed . . . . .	87
The Receiving Water Body Is Impaired, But a Total Maximum Daily Load Has Not Yet Been Implemented . . . . .	89
The Receiving Water Body Is Impaired and a Total Maximum Daily Load Has Been Implemented . . . . .	91
References . . . . .	92

## **Chapter Four: An Economic Framework for Evaluating Trading Opportunities—*Lisa Bacon***

Introduction . . . . .	99
Estimating Credit Need . . . . .	102
Example Wastewater Treatment Plant . . . . .	104
Identifying Trading Options . . . . .	104
Possible Sources of Reductions or Credits—Technical Options . . . . .	107
Market Positions . . . . .	108
Potential Credit Sources as They Relate to the Wastewater Treatment Plant's Market Position . . . . .	109
Characterizing Trading Options . . . . .	110
Cost and Cost-Related Factors . . . . .	112
Base Costs . . . . .	115
Funding Sources . . . . .	115
Financing Options . . . . .	116
Project Delivery Options . . . . .	116
Procurement Process . . . . .	117
Implementation Schedules . . . . .	117
Staffing Effects . . . . .	117
Trading Ratios . . . . .	118
Transaction Costs . . . . .	118
Liability and Risk . . . . .	119
Cost of Deferring Requirements . . . . .	120

On the Plus Side—Revenue Opportunities and Other Monetizable Benefits . . . . .120

    Revenue from Water-Quality Credit Sales . . . . .120

    Revenue from Multicredit Sales . . . . .121

    Monetized Value of Ancillary Benefits . . . . .121

Benefits Not Always Easily Monetized But Generally Quantifiable . . . .121

Environmental Effectiveness: The Divisor in the Cost-Effectiveness Equation . . . . .123

    Capacity for Reductions . . . . .123

    Scalability and Divisibility . . . . .123

    Reduction Profile over Time . . . . .124

    Variability . . . . .124

Evaluating the Cost and Benefits of Trading Options . . . . .125

Evaluating Trading Options . . . . .126

    Defining the Trading Options to Be Evaluated . . . . .127

    Selecting the Decision Criteria . . . . .128

    Applying the Decision Criteria and Evaluating the Options . . . . .136

Develop Trading Proposals . . . . .140

References . . . . .141

## Chapter Five: Trade—*Cy Jones*

Introduction . . . . .146

General Trading Considerations . . . . .146

    Identifying and Quantifying Trading Needs . . . . .146

    Eligibility to Trade . . . . .149

    Finding Trading Partners . . . . .150

        Types of Potential Trading Partners . . . . .150

        Where to Look for Potential Point-Source Trading Partners . . . . .151

        Where to Look for Potential Nonpoint-Source Trading Partners . . . .152

        Third-Party Sources . . . . .154

*Water-Quality Trading: A Guide for the Wastewater Community*

Special Issues with Point–Nonpoint-Source Trading .....	156
Quantifying Nonpoint-Source-Pollutant Loads and Reductions .....	157
<i>Trading Baselines for Farmers</i> .....	160
Solving the Nonpoint-Source Uncertainty in Trades .....	161
<i>Avoiding Nonpoint-Source Uncertainty in Trades</i> .....	163
Trading Ratios .....	163
Uncertainty Ratio .....	164
<i>Cherry Creek Basin Phosphorus Credit Trading Program Use of</i> <i>Trading Ratios</i> .....	165
Delivery Ratio .....	166
<i>Connecticut Long Island Sound Nitrogen Trading Program Use of</i> <i>Delivery Ratios</i> .....	166
Retirement Ratio .....	168
<i>Kalamazoo River Basin Phosphorus Trading Program Use of</i> <i>Trading Ratios</i> .....	169
Cross-Pollutant Ratio .....	170
Credit for Multiple Benefits .....	171
<i>Rahr Malting Company Phosphorus Trades and</i> <i>Multiple Benefits</i> .....	173
Water Quality Revisited—Local Effects Because of Trades .....	173
<i>Protecting Local Water Quality from Adverse Effects Because of</i> <i>Trades—An Example</i> .....	175
Trading Instruments .....	175
Contracts and Agreements .....	176
Managed Trading .....	177
Trading Associations .....	177
<i>A Nutrient-Sensitive Waters Implementation Strategy: An</i> <i>Agreement between the Tar-Pamlico Trading Association</i> <i>and the North Carolina Department of Water Quality,</i> <i>Division of Environmental Management, 1989</i> .....	177
Marketlike Trading .....	180
Contracts with Other Wastewater Treatment Plants .....	180
Contracts with Individual Nonpoint Sources .....	181

Contracts with Middlemen .....	184
Trades and National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits .....	187
U.S. EPA Water-Quality Trading Policy Permit Provisions .....	188
Required Elements in a National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit .....	189
Optional Approaches for Specific Trading Provisions .....	189
Inclusion of Numeric Limits .....	191
Compliance and Enforcement Provisions .....	191
Public Opportunity for Comment and Avoidance of Permit Modifications .....	193
Watershed-Based Discharge Permits .....	194
<i>Neuse River Compliance Association General Permit</i> .....	195
<i>Integrated Municipal Permits</i> .....	196
<i>Louisville and Jefferson County Metropolitan Sewer District</i> .....	196
<i>Clean Water Services</i> .....	197
Wastewater Treatment Plant Goals for National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permits .....	198
<i>Justification for Annual Permit Limits for Nitrogen and     Phosphorus in the Chesapeake Bay Watershed</i> .....	199
Conclusion .....	200
References .....	202

## Chapter Six: Science, Data, and Analytical Needs—*David Sheridan*

Introduction .....	208
Two Aspects of Uncertainty: Science and Humans .....	209
Getting into the Spirit: Collaborate, Coordinate, and Communicate .....	210
Uncertainty in the Science: Data and Modeling .....	215



## *Water-Quality Trading: A Guide for the Wastewater Community*

Data Issues .....	215
<i>Florida Department of Environmental Protection: Number     of Samples Needed to Assess Criterion Exceedance</i> .....	217
Data Issues Continued .....	218
Implications for Wastewater Treatment Plant Managers .....	220
Modeling Issues .....	223
<i>Neuse River Estuary Modeling Study</i> .....	227
Modeling Issues Continued .....	228
Effect of Scientific Uncertainty on Water-Quality Trading .....	228
Summary: Do Not Despair .....	230
The Human Factor .....	231
<i>Stakeholder Involvement in the Development of the         Connecticut Long Island Sound Nitrogen Trading Program</i> .....	232
Conclusion .....	233
References .....	234

## **Chapter Seven: Societal Requirements for Water-Quality Trading—Cy Jones**

Introduction .....	240
Trading Program Criteria .....	240
Necessary Program Elements .....	241
General Program Elements .....	242
Policy Direction .....	242
Program Design .....	242
Public Input and Transparency .....	243
Program Evaluation and Revision .....	244
Program Elements to Ensure Equivalence .....	245

Data Sufficiency .....245  
 Analytical Tools .....245  
 Assessing Water-Quality Results .....246  
 Dealing with Uncertainty .....246  
 Program Elements to Ensure Additionality .....246  
 Program Elements to Ensure Efficiency .....247  
 Program Elements to Ensure Accountability .....248  
     Determination of Compliance .....248  
     Enforcement .....249  
 References .....249

## Chapter Eight: Gaining Public Acceptance— *Mark S. Kieser*

Introduction .....252  
 Typical Objections and Barriers to Water-Quality Trading .....253  
 Identifying and Involving Stakeholders .....254  
     *Stakeholder Involvement Ground Rules Adopted in the  
     Kalamazoo River Trading Demonstration Project* .....255  
 Guidelines for Successful Stakeholder Involvement .....256  
     Leadership .....256  
     Communication .....256  
     Stakeholder Interests and Motives .....257  
     Common Goals .....257  
     Consensus and Progress .....257  
     Document Decisions .....258  
 Conclusion .....258  
 References .....259

## **Chapter Nine: Making the Decision—*Cy Jones***

Introduction .....	262
The Trading Checklist .....	262
Conclusion .....	264

<b>List of Acronyms .....</b>	<b>265</b>
-------------------------------	------------

<b>Glossary .....</b>	<b>271</b>
-----------------------	------------

<b>Appendix A: A Synopsis of Michigan’s Water-Quality-Trading Regulations .....</b>	<b>277</b>
---	------------

<b>Appendix B: Best Management Practice List for the Lower Boise River Pollution Trading Program .....</b>	<b>301</b>
--	------------

<b>Appendix C: Perpetual Conservation Easement .....</b>	<b>309</b>
--	------------

<b>Appendix D: Water-Quality-Trading Resources</b>	
<b>Environmental Trading Network</b> .....	315
<b>Index</b> .....	321