



HCI MODELS, THEORIES,

AND FRAMEWORKS

TOWARD A MULTIDISCIPLINARY SCIENCE EDITED BY JOHN M. CARROLL

Contents

Acknowledgments

xvii

| | | |
|-------|---|----|
| 1 | Introduction: Toward a Multidisciplinary Science of Human-Computer Interaction | 1 |
| | <i>by John M. Carroll, Virginia Tech</i> | |
| 1.1 | The Golden Age | 2 |
| 1.2 | Let 100 Flowers Blossom | 4 |
| 1.3 | Scientific Fragmentation | 5 |
| 1.4 | Teaching and Learning | 7 |
| 2 | Design as Applied Perception | 11 |
| | <i>by Colin Ware, University of New Hampshire</i> | |
| 2.1 | Motivation | 11 |
| 2.2 | Scientific Foundation | 12 |
| 2.2.1 | Stage 1: Features in Early Vision | 13 |
| 2.2.2 | Stage 2: Pattern Perception | 16 |
| 2.2.3 | Stage 3: Objects | 18 |
| 2.2.4 | Claims and Limitations | 20 |
| 2.3 | Case Study | 22 |
| 2.4 | Current Status of Theoretical Approach | 23 |
| 2.4.1 | Application | 25 |

| | | |
|----------|--|-----------|
| 3 | Motor Behavior Models for Human-Computer Interaction | 27 |
| | <i>by I. Scott MacKenzie, York University, Toronto, Canada</i> | |
| 3.1 | Motivation | 27 |
| 3.2 | Overview: Models and Modeling | 27 |
| 3.2.1 | Predictive Models | 28 |
| 3.2.2 | Descriptive Models | 30 |
| 3.3 | Scientific Foundations and Model Descriptions | 35 |
| 3.3.1 | Fitts' Law | 35 |
| 3.3.2 | Guiard's Model of Bimanual Skill | 40 |
| 3.4 | Case Studies | 43 |
| 3.4.1 | Case Study #1: Fitts' Law Predictions of Text-Entry Rates on Mobile Phones | 43 |
| 3.4.2 | Case Study #2: Bimanual Control and Desktop Computer Affordances | 48 |
| 3.5 | Current Status and Further Reading | 53 |
| | | |
| 4 | Information Processing and Skilled Behavior | 55 |
| | <i>by Bonnie E. John, Carnegie Mellon University</i> | |
| 4.1 | Motivation for Using the Human Information Processing Theory in Human-Computer Interaction | 55 |
| 4.2 | Overview of GOMS | 59 |
| 4.3 | Scientific Foundations Underlying GOMS | 62 |
| 4.3.1 | Conceptual Frameworks | 64 |
| 4.3.2 | Computational Cognitive Architectures | 69 |
| 4.3.3 | Task-Analysis Techniques | 70 |
| 4.4 | Detailed Description of GOMS Models | 72 |
| 4.4.1 | KLM | 72 |
| 4.4.2 | CMN-GOMS | 75 |
| 4.4.3 | CPM-GOMS | 78 |
| 4.5 | Case Study: Project Ernestine | 84 |
| 4.5.1 | Details of Project Ernestine's CPM-GOMS Modeling Effort | 86 |

- 4.6 **Current Status** 97
 - 4.6.1 GOMS in Particular 97
 - 4.6.2 Human Information Processing in General 98
- 4.7 **Further Reading** 100
 - 4.7.1 Seminal Text in Human Information Processing 100
 - 4.7.2 Human Information Processing in HCI 100
 - 4.7.3 Human Information Processing Embodied in Computational Cognitive Architectures 100

5 Notational Systems—The Cognitive Dimensions of Notations Framework 103

*by Alan Blackwell, Cambridge University, Cambridge, England
Thomas Green, University of Leeds, Leeds, England*

- 5.1 **Motivation** 103
 - 5.1.1 Example 104
- 5.2 **Overview** 106
- 5.3 **Scientific Foundations** 109
- 5.4 **Detailed Description** 112
 - 5.4.1 Activities 113
 - 5.4.2 The Components of Notational Systems 113
 - 5.4.3 Notational Dimensions 115
 - 5.4.4 Profiles 118
 - 5.4.5 Trade-Offs 118
 - 5.4.6 Use by an Analyst 119
 - 5.4.7 A Questionnaire Approach 120
 - 5.4.8 Cognitive Dimensions of Interactive Devices 121
- 5.5 **Case Study: Evaluating a Visual-Programming Language** 122
 - 5.5.1 Illustrating the Notation 122
 - 5.5.2 Conclusions 128
- 5.6 **Current Status** 128
 - 5.6.1 Dissemination 128
 - 5.6.2 Clarification and Formalization 129
 - 5.6.3 Coverage 130

- 5.6.4 Analysis Tools 130
- 5.6.5 Beyond CDs: Misfit Analysis 132
- 5.7 Further Reading 133

6 Users' Mental Models: The Very Ideas 135

by Stephen J. Payne, Cardiff University, Wales

- 6.1 Motivation 135
- 6.2 Scientific Foundations 138
 - 6.2.1 Idea 1. Mental Content vs. Cognitive Architecture: Mental Models as Theories 138
 - 6.2.2 Idea 2. Models vs. Methods: Mental Models as Problem Spaces 141
 - 6.2.3 Idea 3. Models vs. Descriptions: Mental Models as Homomorphisms 144
 - 6.2.4 Idea 4. Models of Representations: Mental Models Can Be Derived from Language, Perception, or Imagination 145
- 6.3 Detailed Description 146
 - 6.3.1 Idea 5. Mental Representations of Representational Artifacts 146
 - 6.3.2 Idea 6. Mental Models as Computationally Equivalent to External Representations 149
- 6.4 Case Study 152
 - 6.4.1 A Yoked State Spaces Analysis of Calendar Design 152
 - 6.4.2 Experiments on Internalization of Device Instructions 154

7 Exploring and Finding Information 157

by Peter Pirolli, Palo Alto Research Center

- 7.1 Introduction 157
- 7.2 Motivation: Man the Informavore 157
 - 7.2.1 Emergence of the Global Information Ecology 158
- 7.3 Scientific Foundations 161
 - 7.3.1 Influence of Evolutionary Theory: Adaptationist Approaches 162
 - 7.3.2 Information-Foraging Theory 164
 - 7.3.3 Optimal-Foraging Theory 166
- 7.4 Detailed Description: Scatter/Gather 168
 - 7.4.1 Task Analysis 169

| | | |
|-------|---|-----|
| 7.4.2 | Simulating Users | 171 |
| 7.4.3 | Information Scent | 173 |
| 7.4.4 | Information-Foraging Evaluations | 176 |
| 7.4.5 | Simulating Users and Evaluating Alternative Scatter/Gather Diagrams | 181 |
| 7.5 | Case Study: The World Wide Web | 182 |
| 7.5.1 | Information Scent as a Major Determinant of Web User Behavior | 183 |
| 7.5.2 | Simulated Users and Usability Evaluation | 188 |
| 7.6 | Current Status | 190 |
| | Author Notes | 191 |

8 Distributed Cognition 193

by Mark Perry, Brunel University, London, England

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| 8.1 | Motivation | 193 |
| 8.1.1 | Designing Collaborative Technologies | 194 |
| 8.1.2 | Distributed Cognition in Context | 196 |
| 8.2 | Overview | 197 |
| 8.3 | Scientific Foundations | 198 |
| 8.3.1 | External Support for Thought and Systems Perspectives on Cognition | 200 |
| 8.4 | Detailed Description | 203 |
| 8.4.1 | Computation and Cognition | 204 |
| 8.4.2 | The Social Organization of Group Problem Solving | 209 |
| 8.4.3 | Communication and Coordination of Distributed Knowledge | 210 |
| 8.4.4 | "Doing" DCog | 212 |
| 8.5 | Case Study: Engineering Design and Construction | 214 |
| 8.5.1 | Organizational Coordination and Control in Representation Transformation | 215 |
| 8.5.2 | Representational Transformations in Information Processing | 217 |
| 8.5.3 | Coordination of Representational Transformations | 219 |
| 8.5.4 | Summary | 221 |
| 8.6 | Current Status | 222 |
| | Author Notes | 223 |
| | Further Reading | 223 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 9 | Cognitive Work Analysis | 225 |
| | <i>by Penelope M. Sanderson, University of Queensland, Australia</i> | |
| 9.1 | Motivation | 225 |
| 9.1.1 | Connection of CWA with Other Areas | 226 |
| 9.1.2 | Designing for Unanticipated Events in First-of-a-Kind Systems | 227 |
| 9.2 | Overview of CWA | 229 |
| 9.2.1 | Phases of CWA | 230 |
| 9.3 | Scientific Foundations | 234 |
| 9.3.1 | A Systems Perspective | 235 |
| 9.3.2 | An Ecological Orientation | 236 |
| 9.3.3 | The Role of Cognition | 238 |
| 9.3.4 | Summary | 239 |
| 9.4 | Detailed Description | 239 |
| 9.4.1 | Overviews of CWA | 239 |
| 9.4.2 | Description of CWA Classes of Constraint | 241 |
| 9.4.3 | CWA and the System Life Cycle | 251 |
| 9.5 | Case Studies | 252 |
| 9.5.1 | Display Design | 252 |
| 9.5.2 | Systems Engineering and Human-System Integration | 257 |
| 9.6 | Current Status | 262 |
| | Further Reading | 264 |
| 10 | Common Ground in Electronically Mediated Communication: Clark's Theory of Language Use | 265 |
| | <i>by Andrew Monk, University of York, England</i> | |
| 10.1 | Motivation | 266 |
| 10.1.1 | Production Plus Comprehension Equals Communication | 266 |
| 10.1.2 | Language Use as a Collaborative Activity | 268 |
| 10.2 | Overview | 269 |
| 10.3 | Scientific Foundations | 273 |
| 10.4 | Detailed Description | 274 |
| 10.4.1 | Fundamentals | 274 |
| 10.4.2 | Grounding, Levels, Layers, and Tracks | 277 |

- 10.5 **Case Studies—Applying the Theory to the Design of Technology for Communication** 280
 - 10.5.1 The Costs of Grounding (Clark & Brennan) 280
 - 10.5.2 Why Cognoter Did Not Work (Tatar, Foster, & Bobrow) 283
 - 10.5.3 Predicting the Peripherality of Peripheral Participants (Monk) 285
- 10.6 **Current Status** 288
- 10.7 **Further Reading** 289
- Acknowledgments 289

11 Activity Theory 291

by Olav W. Bertelsen and Susanne Bødker, University of Aarhus, Denmark

- 11.1 **Motivation** 291
 - 11.1.1 Through the Interface—Artifacts Used in Context 291
 - 11.1.2 In Search of a New Theoretical Foundation 293
 - 11.1.3 What Does It Offer? 293
 - 11.1.4 What Is It Like? 294
 - 11.1.5 What Sets It Apart? 294
- 11.2 **Overview** 295
- 11.3 **Scientific Foundations** 298
- 11.4 **Detailed Description** 304
 - 11.4.1 Mediation 306
 - 11.4.2 Internationalization—Externalization 310
 - 11.4.3 Computer Artifacts in a Web of Activities 311
 - 11.4.4 Development 312
 - 11.4.5 Activity Theory in Practical Design and Evaluation 315
- 11.5 **Case Study** 316
 - 11.5.1 Focus and Focus Shifts 317
 - 11.5.2 The Concept of Artifacts in Use as a Tool in the Redesign of the CPN Tool 320
 - 11.5.3 The User Interface 321
- 11.6 **Current Status** 322
- 11.7 **Further Reading** 324

| | | |
|-----------|---|------------|
| 12 | Applying Social Psychological Theory to the Problems of Group Work | 325 |
| | <i>by Robert E. Kraut, Carnegie Mellon University</i> | |
| 12.1 | Motivation | 325 |
| 12.2 | An Overview of CSCW Research | 327 |
| 12.3 | Scientific Foundations | 328 |
| 12.3.1 | Input-Process-Output Models of Group Functioning | 329 |
| 12.3.2 | Process Losses | 338 |
| 12.3.3 | Social Loafing | 341 |
| 12.4 | Detailed Description—Explaining Productivity Loss in Brainstorming Teams | 343 |
| 12.4.1 | Application to System Design | 346 |
| 12.5 | Case Study: Applying Social Psychological Theory to the Problem of Undercontribution to Online Groups | 348 |
| 12.5.1 | Social Loafing and Online Groups | 348 |
| 12.6 | Current Status | 353 |
| | | |
| 13 | Studies of Work in Human-Computer Interaction | 357 |
| | <i>by Graham Button, Xerox Research Centre Europe, Grenoble, France</i> | |
| 13.1 | Motivation | 357 |
| 13.2 | Overview: A Paradigmatic Case | 359 |
| 13.3 | Scientific Foundations | 362 |
| 13.3.1 | Ethnography | 363 |
| 13.3.2 | Situated Action | 364 |
| 13.3.3 | Ethnomethodology | 366 |
| 13.4 | Detailed Description | 369 |
| 13.4.1 | Critique | 370 |
| 13.4.2 | Evaluation | 371 |
| 13.4.3 | Requirements | 372 |
| 13.4.4 | Foundational Reconceptualizations | 373 |
| 13.5 | Case Study | 374 |
| 13.6 | Current Status | 379 |
| 13.7 | Further Reading | 380 |

| | | |
|-----------|--|------------|
| 14 | Upside-Down Vs and Algorithms—Computational Formalisms and Theory | 381 |
| | <i>by Alan Dix, Lancaster University, England</i> | |
| 14.1 | Motivation | 381 |
| 14.1.1 | What Is Formal? | 382 |
| 14.1.2 | The Myth of Informality | 384 |
| 14.1.3 | Chapter Structure | 385 |
| 14.2 | Overview of Issues and First Steps in Formalism | 385 |
| 14.2.1 | Two Examples | 385 |
| 14.2.2 | Lessons | 388 |
| 14.3 | Scientific Foundations | 389 |
| 14.3.1 | A Brief History of Formalism | 390 |
| 14.3.2 | The Limits of Knowledge | 392 |
| 14.3.3 | The Theory of Computing | 392 |
| 14.3.4 | Complexity | 394 |
| 14.3.5 | Good Enough | 396 |
| 14.3.6 | Agents and Interaction | 397 |
| 14.3.7 | Notations and Specifications | 399 |
| 14.3.8 | Kinds of Notation | 399 |
| 14.4 | Detailed Description | 400 |
| 14.4.1 | Two Plus Two—Using Simple Calculation | 400 |
| 14.4.2 | Detailed Specification | 403 |
| 14.4.3 | Modeling for Generic Issues | 406 |
| 14.4.4 | Computer-Supported Cooperative Work and Groupware | 407 |
| 14.4.5 | Time and Continuous Interaction | 408 |
| 14.4.6 | Paradigms and Inspiration | 409 |
| 14.4.7 | Socio-Organizational Church-Turing Hypothesis | 412 |
| 14.5 | Case Study—Dialogue Specification for Transaction Processing | 413 |
| 14.5.1 | Background—Transaction Processing | 414 |
| 14.5.2 | The Problem . . . | 415 |
| 14.5.3 | All About State | 417 |
| 14.5.4 | The Solution | 418 |
| 14.5.5 | Why It Worked . . . | 420 |
| 14.6 | Current Status | 422 |
| 14.6.1 | Retrospective—Formal Methods in Computing | 422 |

| | | |
|--------|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 14.6.2 | Retrospective—Formal Methods in HCI | 423 |
| 14.6.3 | Prospective | 425 |
| 14.7 | Further Reading | 428 |

| | | |
|--------|---|---------|
| 15 | Design Rationale as Theory | 431 |
| | <i>by John M. Carroll and Mary Beth Rosson, Virginia Tech</i> | |
| 15.1 | Motivation | 432 |
| 15.2 | Overview | 434 |
| 15.3 | Scientific Foundations | 439 |
| 15.3.1 | Ecological Science | 439 |
| 15.3.2 | Action Science | 442 |
| 15.3.3 | Synthetic Science | 443 |
| 15.4 | Detailed Description | 444 |
| 15.5 | Case Study | 446 |
| 15.5.1 | MOOsburg as a Case Study in Action Science | 447 |
| 15.5.2 | MOOsburg as a Case Study in Ecological Science | 451 |
| 15.5.3 | MOOsburg as a Case Study in Synthetic Science | 456 |
| 15.6 | Current Status and Further Reading | 460 |
| | Acknowledgments | 461 |
| | Glossary | 463 |
| | References | 475 |
| | Index | 521 |
| | About the Authors | 547 |