

HAND BOOKS

IN ECONOMICS

Kenneth J. Arrow
Amartya Sen
Kotaro Suzumura

Social Choice and Welfare

VOLUME 2

NORTH-HOLLAND

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	xvii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xix
Part Five Foundations	1
13 Kenneth Arrow on Social Choice Theory	3
Kenneth Arrow, Amartya Sen, and Kotaro Suzumura	
Part I: An Editorial Note	3
Part II: An Interview with Kenneth J. Arrow	4
References	23
Part III: The Classification of Social Choice Propositions	24
14 The Informational Basis of Social Choice	29
Amartya Sen	
1. Introduction	29
2. Democratic Priorities and Informational Inclusiveness	32
3. Informational Exclusions and Social Choice Framework	34
4. Axiomatic Exclusions and Arrow's Impossibility Theorem	37
4.1. Arrow's Theorem	37
4.2. Proof of Arrow's Theorem	38
4.3. Interpretation of the Proof	39
5. Enriching Information for the Possibility of Social Choice	40
6. On Combining Utility and Nonutility Information	41
References	43
15 Competitive Market Mechanisms as Social Choice Procedures	47
Peter J. Hammond	
1. Introduction and Outline	50
1.1. Markets and Social Choice	50
1.2. Finite Economies	50
1.3. Continuum Economies	51
1.4. Public Goods and Externalities	52
2. Agent Types	52
2.1. Commodity Space	52
2.2. Notation	52
2.3. Consumption and Production Sets	53
2.4. Preferences for Consumption	53
2.5. Regular Smooth Preferences	55
2.6. Preferences for Net Trades	56

2.7.	A Compact Polish Space of Agents' Types	57
2.8.	Smooth Type Domains	58
3.	Walrasian Equilibrium and Pareto Efficiency	59
3.1.	Finite Set of Agents	59
3.2.	Feasible and Pareto Efficient Allocations	60
3.3.	Wealth Distribution and Walrasian Equilibrium	60
3.4.	Compensated Walrasian Equilibrium	61
3.5.	Properties of Compensated and Walrasian Equilibria	63
3.6.	Walrasian Equilibrium with Equal Budgets	64
3.7.	The Cheaper Point Lemma	66
3.8.	The Unique Cheapest Point Case	67
3.9.	Aggregate Interiority	67
4.	Characterizing Pareto Efficient Allocations	68
4.1.	First Efficiency Theorem	68
4.2.	Second Efficiency Theorem	68
4.3.	Identical Agents	69
4.4.	Nonoligarchic Allocations	70
4.5.	Exact Characterization of Nonoligarchic Allocations	72
4.6.	Oligarchic Allocations and Hierarchical Prices	72
5.	Walrasian Equilibrium in Finite Economies	74
5.1.	Autarky	75
5.2.	Gains from Trade	75
5.3.	Existence of Compensated Walrasian Equilibrium	76
5.4.	Directional Irreducibility and Existence of Walrasian Equilibrium	79
5.5.	Extended Irreducibility	82
6.	Characterizations of WE with a Fixed Profile of Agents' Types	84
6.1.	Walrasian Acceptability	84
6.2.	Equal Rights to Multiple Proportional Trade	85
6.3.	Interactive Opportunity Sets	87
7.	Characterizations of WE with a Variable Profile of Agents' Types	89
7.1.	Minimal Message Spaces	89
7.2.	Gevers' Theorem	91
7.3.	A Maximally Selective Social Choice Rule	93
7.4.	Local Independence in Smooth Economies	94
7.5.	Strategyproofness with Exogenous Prices	95
8.	Characterizations of WE with a Varying Number of Agents	97
8.1.	The Core and Edgeworth Equilibrium	97
8.2.	Another Limit Theorem	99
8.3.	Stability	99
8.4.	Consistency and Converse Consistency	103
8.5.	Consistency and Converse Consistency with Interactive Opportunity Sets	104
8.6.	Minimal Message Spaces	105

9. Statistical Continuum Economies	105
9.1. Continuum Economies	105
9.2. Statistical Economies	106
9.3. Statistical Continuum Economies	106
9.4. Allocation Mechanisms	107
9.5. Pareto Efficiency	108
9.6. Walrasian and Compensated Equilibria	108
9.7. Lump-Sum Wealth Redistribution	109
9.8. Walrasian Equilibrium with Equal Budgets	109
10. Efficiency Theorems in Continuum Economies	109
10.1. First Efficiency Theorem	109
10.2. Second Efficiency Theorem	110
10.3. Nonoligarchic Allocations	111
10.4. Individual Nonconvexities	112
11. Statistical Continuum Economies: Existence Theorems	114
11.1. Integrably Bounded Gains from Trade Sets	114
11.2. Continuity of the Budget and Demand Correspondences	115
11.3. Integrably Bounded Restricted Budget and Demand Correspondences	116
11.4. Existence of Compensated Equilibrium with Free Disposal	117
11.5. Monotone Preferences and Existence of Compensated Equilibrium	120
11.6. Existence of Walrasian Equilibrium	120
11.7. Indivisible Goods and Constrained Monotone Preferences	121
11.8. Dispersion and Existence of Walrasian Equilibrium	122
12. Equivalence Theorems for the Core and f -Core	123
12.1. The Core and f -Core	123
12.2. Walrasian Equilibria Belong to the Core	124
12.3. f -Core Allocations are Compensated Equilibria	124
12.4. Coalitional Fairness	126
12.5. A Bargaining Set	127
13. Envy-Free Mechanisms	129
13.1. Full f -Pareto Efficiency	129
13.2. Self-Selective Allocations	129
13.3. Counterexample	132
13.4. Fully Fair Allocations	132
14. Strategyproof Mechanisms in a Continuum Economy	133
14.1. Individual Strategyproofness	133
14.2. Decentralization Theorem	134
14.3. Limits to Redistribution	136
14.4. Anonymity	136
14.5. Weak Gains from Trade with an Inclusive Type Domain	137
14.6. Strategyproof Mechanisms of Maximal Dimension	138
15. Manipulation by Finite Coalitions	139
15.1. Multilateral Strategyproofness	139
15.2. Arbitrage-Free Allocations	140

16. Other Environments	142
16.1. Public Goods	142
16.2. Externalities	143
Acknowledgments	144
References	144
16 Functionings and Capabilities	153
Kaushik Basu and Luis F. López-Calva	
1. The Capabilities Approach: An Introduction	154
2. The Ideas in History	156
3. Sen's Critique and Formulation	159
4. Further Formalizations	164
5. Capability, Preference, and Choice	169
6. Applications of the Capabilities Approach to Poverty Measurement and Gender Issues	175
7. Capability and Exclusion	177
8. The Human Development Index	179
9. Concluding Remarks	182
Acknowledgments	182
References	183
Part Six Developments of the Basic Arrovian Schemes	189
17 Arrovian Social Choice Theory on Economic Domains	191
Michel Le Breton and John A. Weymark	
1. Introduction	192
Part I: Social Welfare Functions	195
2. Arrow's Theorem	195
3. Single-Peaked Preferences	198
4. Saturating Preference Domains	203
4.1. Preliminaries	203
4.2. The Kalai-Muller-Satterthwaite Theorem	206
4.3. Further Properties of Saturating Preference Domains	208
5. Examples of Saturating Preference Domains	209
6. Topological Domain Restrictions for Public Goods	224
7. Supersaturating Preference Domains	233
8. Hypersaturating Preference Domains	239
9. Topological Domain Restrictions for Private Goods	243
10. Non-Cartesian Sets of Alternatives	245
10.1. Assignments of Indivisible Objects	245
10.2. Exchange Economies	250
11. Effective Social Welfare Functions	255

Part II: Social Choice Correspondences	257
12. A Choice-Theoretic Version of Arrow's Theorem	257
12.1. The Arrow Choice Axioms	257
12.2. Arrow's Theorem	262
13. Unrestricted Preference Domains	262
13.1. The Grether–Plott Theorem	263
13.2. Strategic Candidacy	265
13.3. Fixed Feasible Alternatives	267
14. Single-Peaked Preferences and Interval Agenda Domains	271
15. Analytic Preference Domains	274
15.1. Euclidean Spatial Preferences	275
15.2. Monotone Analytic Preferences	276
16. Classical Domains of Spatial and Economic Preferences	277
16.1. Exchange Economies	278
16.2. Production Economies	281
16.3. General Spatial Preferences	283
17. Independence of Pareto Irrelevant Alternatives	286
17.1. Nonconvex Agendas	286
17.2. Convex Agendas	288
18. Concluding Remarks	292
Acknowledgments	296
References	296
18 Topological Theories of Social Choice	301
Nicholas Bálgent	
1. Introduction	302
2. Chichilnisky's Theorem: An Elementary Introduction	302
2.1. Linear Preferences	302
2.2. Chichilnisky's Impossibility Theorem	304
2.3. Loops	306
2.4. Fundamental Equation of Topological Social Choice Theory	310
2.5. Proof of Theorem 1	313
3. Domain Restriction	315
3.1. Domain Restriction	316
3.2. Contractibility	316
4. Weak Pareto and No Veto	317
4.1. The Cone Property and the No Veto Property	317
5. Strategic Manipulators and Homotopic Dictators	316
5.1. Dropping the No Veto Property	320
6. Continuity	323
6.1. Justification	323
6.2. Limitations of Continuity	325
7. Topological Proof of Arrow's Theorem	326
7.1. Nerves	326

7.2. Loops in Nerves	329
7.3. Arrow's Theorem	331
8. Conclusion	332
Acknowledgments	333
References	333
19 Nonbinary Social Choice	335
Rajat Deb	
1. Introduction	335
2. Choice Functions and Domain Restrictions	337
3. Consistency and Rationalizability	339
4. Nonbinary Social Choice: A Definition	342
5. Social Choice: Some Standard Concepts	343
6. Dictatorship and Oligarchy: The Fixed Agenda Case	345
6.1. Social Choice with a Fixed Agenda: Hansson's Independence Condition	346
6.2. Social Choice with a Fixed Agenda: Sen's Approach to the Independence Condition	349
7. Dictatorship and Oligarchy: With Multiple Agendas	355
8. Conclusion	364
Acknowledgments	365
References	365
20 Social Choice with Fuzzy Preferences	367
Richard Barrett and Maurice Salles	
1. Introduction	367
2. Fuzzy Preferences	369
2.1. Fuzzy Preferences: Numerical Values	370
2.2. Fuzzy Preferences: Qualitative Values	372
3. Aggregation of Fuzzy Preferences: Arrovian Theorems	374
3.1. The Case of Numerical Values	374
3.2. The Case of Qualitative Values	378
4. Other Aspects	380
4.1. Aggregation of Fuzzy Preferences and Sen's Impossibility Theorem	381
4.2. Aggregation of Fuzzy Preferences and Economic Environments	382
5. Concluding Remarks	386
Acknowledgments	387
References	387
Part Seven Fairness and Rights	391
21 Fair Allocation Rules	393
William Thomson	
1. Introduction	395
2. A Note on the Approach Followed	397

3.	The Classical Problem of Fair Division	399
4.	Equitable Allocations	401
4.1.	Comparisons to Equal Division	401
4.2.	No-Domination	402
4.3.	No-Envy	402
4.4.	Concepts Related to No-Envy	407
4.5.	Selections and Rankings	409
4.6.	Economies with a Large Number of Agents	411
4.7.	Equity Criteria for Groups	413
4.8.	Egalitarian-Equivalence	415
4.9.	Equitable Trades	417
4.10.	Towards a Complete Theory of Equity	419
5.	Economies with Production	423
5.1.	Adapting the Basic Concepts	423
5.2.	Agent-by-Agent Lower and Upper Bounds	426
6.	Equal Opportunities as Equal, or Equivalent, Choice Sets	428
6.1.	Equal Opportunities	429
6.2.	Equal-Opportunity-Equivalence	430
6.3.	No Envy of Opportunities	431
7.	Monotonicity	432
7.1.	Resource-Monotonicity	433
7.2.	Welfare-Domination under Preference-Replacement	436
7.3.	Technology-Monotonicity	438
7.4.	Population-Monotonicity	441
7.5.	Monotonicity in Economies with Individual Endowments	443
8.	Consistency and Related Properties	444
8.1.	Consistency and converse consistency	444
8.2.	Minimal Consistent Enlargements	449
8.3.	Consistency in Economies with Individual Endowments	450
9.	Public Goods	451
9.1.	Basic Solutions	451
9.2.	Notions of Equal, or Equivalent, Opportunities	455
9.3.	Social Endowment Monotonicity	455
9.4.	Technology-Monotonicity	455
9.5.	Welfare-Domination under Preference-Replacement	456
9.6.	Monotonicity in Economies with Individual Endowments	456
9.7.	Population-Monotonicity	456
9.8.	Consistency	458
10.	Indivisible Goods	458
10.1.	The Model	458
10.2.	Basic Solutions	460
10.3.	Resource-Monotonicity	464
10.4.	Welfare-Domination under Preference-Replacement	466
10.5.	Population-Monotonicity	466

10.6. Consistency	468
10.7. Related Models	470
11. Single-Peaked Preferences	476
11.1. The Model	477
11.2. Basic Solutions	477
11.3. Resource-Monotonicity	479
11.4. Welfare-Domination under Preference-Replacement	480
11.5. Separability	481
11.6. Population-Monotonicity	481
11.7. Consistency	482
11.8. Extensions and Related Models	483
12. Nonhomogeneous Continuum	485
13. Other Domains and Issues	489
14. Conclusion	489
Acknowledgments	492
References	492
 22 Compensation and Responsibility	 507
<i>Marc Fleurbaey and François Maniquet</i>	
1. Introduction	508
2. Fair Monetary Compensation	517
2.1. The Model	517
2.2. Fairness as No-Envy, and Related Solutions	519
2.3. Axioms and Ethical Principles	526
2.4. The Quasi-Linear Case	536
3. Unequal Productive Skills	546
3.1. The Model	547
3.2. Fairness in Compensation and Reward	549
3.3. Bundle Equality and Welfare Lower Bounds	561
3.4. Limited Self-Ownership	566
4. The Utilitarian Approach to Responsibility	568
4.1. Framework	568
4.2. Social Welfare Functions	571
4.3. Min-of-Means or Mean-of-Mins?	573
5. Related Literature	582
5.1. Ranking Distributions of Opportunity Sets	582
5.2. Extended Insurance	584
5.3. Extended Sympathy and Interpersonal Comparisons of Utility	585
5.4. Bargaining	587
5.5. Surplus-Sharing and Cost-Sharing Approach	588
5.6. Opinions	590
5.7. Applications	591

6. Conclusion	595
Acknowledgments	597
References	598
23 Welfarism, Individual Rights, and Procedural Fairness	605
Kotaro Suzumura	
1. Introduction	606
2. Informational Bases of Normative Welfare Judgments	607
3. Social Welfare, Individual Rights, and Liberal Paradox	611
4. Proposed Resolution Schemes for Paretian Liberal Paradox	618
4.1. Voluntary Alienation of Conferred Libertarian Rights	620
4.2. Voluntary Exchange of Conferred Libertarian Rights	625
4.3. Liberal Individual as the Base of the Liberal Society	628
4.4. Ethical Constraints on the Exercise of Conferred Libertarian Rights	633
5. Critiques on Sen's Formulation of Individual Rights	642
6. Formulation, Realization, and Initial Conferment of Rights	646
7. Liberal Paradoxes with Game Form Rights	653
7.1. Power Structure Generated by Game Form Rights	653
7.2. Gibbard Paradox with Game Form Rights	658
7.3. Pareto Libertarian Paradox with Game Form Rights	660
8. Initial Conferment of Game Form Rights	666
9. Some Further Remarks on Paretianism	670
9.1. The Paretian Epidemic and Its Implications	670
9.2. Nonwelfaristic Policy Assessment and the Pareto Principle	674
10. Concluding Remarks	675
Acknowledgments	677
References	677
24 Freedom, Opportunity, and Well-Being	687
James E. Foster	
1. Introduction	688
2. Notation	693
3. Freedom counts	693
3.1. Rankings and Axioms	694
3.2. Additive Representations and Cardinality Freedom	699
3.3. Reflections on Counting as a Measure of Freedom	701
4. Preference and Indirect Utility	702
4.1. Rankings and Axioms	702
4.2. Representations of Indirect Utility Freedom	705
4.3. Combining Cardinality and Indirect Utility	706
4.4. Other Views of Quality	709
4.5. Reflections on Indirect Utility as a Measure of Freedom	711
5. Plural Preferences and Effective Freedom	711
5.1. Rankings and Axioms	712

5.2. Representations and Measures	716
5.3. Sen's Subrelation and Arrow's Extension	718
5.4. Reflections on Plural Preferences and Effective Freedom	723
6. Conclusions	724
Acknowledgments	725
References	725

Part Eight Voting and Manipulation **729**

25 Strategyproof Social Choice **731**

Salvador Barberà

1. The Purpose and Limitations of This Survey	732
2. Introduction: A Few Historical Notes	733
3. Strategyproof Social Choice Functions for Unrestricted Domains: The Gibbard–Satterthwaite Theorem	738
3.1. Statement	738
3.2. The Impact of the Gibbard–Satterthwaite Theorem	741
3.3. Proofs of the Theorem	743
4. Game Forms and the Question of Implementation	748
4.1. Strategyproofness in a Larger Picture	748
4.2. Strengthenings, Weakenings, and Related Definitions	750
4.3. Other Forms of Strategic Behavior in Voting	752
4.4. The Analysis of Specific Social Choice Rules	753
5. The Search for Strategyproofness: An Outline	754
6. Common Domains: Strategyproof Rules for the Choice of Multi-attribute Alternatives	758
6.1. Two Alternatives	759
6.2. Linearly Ordered Sets of Alternatives	759
6.3. n -Dimensional Grids	765
6.4. Constraints: A First Approach	772
6.5. The Structure of Strategyproof Rules	774
6.6. Constraints Revisited	779
7. Common Domains: Probabilistic Voting Schemes	780
8. Common Domains: Social Choice Correspondences	787
9. Strategyproofness in Personalized Domains	794
9.1. Strategyproof Rationing	794
9.2. Strategyproof Exchange	798
9.3. Strategyproof Matching and Assignment	807
9.4. Strategyproof Cost Sharing	811
10. Further Comments on Preference Domains	815
10.1. Some Special Domains	815
10.2. Maximal Domains	817
11. Some Final Remarks	817
Acknowledgments	818
References	819

26 Probabilistic and Spatial Models of Voting	833
Peter Coughlin	
1. Black's Analysis of Committees and Related Results about Majority Rule	834
1.1. Voters, Alternatives, and Preferences	835
1.2. Simple Majority Rule	835
1.3. Single-Peakedness and Median Alternatives	836
1.4. Results for Committees and for the General Model	837
2. Hotelling, Downs, and Electoral Competition	840
2.1. Hotelling's Model for Duopolists	841
2.2. Interpretation as a Model of Electoral Competition	842
3. A Framework for Models of Electoral Competition	844
3.1. Basic Assumptions and Notation	844
3.2. Possible Objectives	848
4. Deterministic Voting and Simple Majority Rule	852
4.1. Definitions	852
4.2. Pure-Strategy Equilibria and Condorcet Winners	853
5. Unidimensional Models with Deterministic Voting	854
6. Finite-Dimensional Models with Deterministic Voting	858
6.1. Plott's Analysis	859
6.2. Sufficient Conditions	860
6.3. McKelvey's Theorem	865
6.4. Summing Up	867
7. Probabilistic Voting Models	867
7.1. An Overview	867
7.2. Reasons for Analyzing Probabilistic Voting Models	867
8. Unidimensional Models with Probabilistic Voting	869
9. Finite-Dimensional Models with Probabilistic Voting	871
9.1. Hinich's Model	871
9.2. Expectations Based on a Binary Luce Model	874
9.3. Lindbeck and Weibull's Model	879
10. Probabilistic Voting Models with Fixed Candidate Characteristics and Voter Predictions	881
10.1. Fixed Candidate Characteristics	881
10.2. Predictive Maps	883
10.3. Summing Up	886
11. Alternative Solution Concepts	886
11.1. A Dynamical Approach	887
11.2. Mixed-Strategy Equilibria	888
11.3. Some Other Solutions That Have Been Proposed	891
12. Conclusion	892
Acknowledgments	892
References	892

27 Geometry of Voting	897
Donald G. Saari	.
1. Introduction	898
2. From Simple Geometry to Profile Coordinates	899
2.1. Using Geometry to Represent Profiles	899
2.2. Different Information, Different Voting Outcomes	901
2.3. Profile Coordinates	903
2.4. Resolving Classical Problems and "Paradoxes"	911
3. Geometry of the Likelihoods of Voting Problems	913
3.1. Central Limit Theorem	913
3.2. Geometry of Paired Comparisons	914
3.3. Geometric Likelihood Estimates	917
3.4. <i>Explaining and Interpreting Pairwise Voting Outcomes</i>	918
3.5. Geometry of All Three-Candidate Pairwise and Positional Outcomes	920
4. Other Geometric Voting Results	924
4.1. Paired Comparisons: Extending McGarey's Theorem	925
4.2. Geometry of Strategic Behavior	927
4.3. <i>Could My Candidate Have Won with a Different Voting Rule?</i>	930
5. Exporting Lessons Learned From Social Choice	936
5.1. From Voting to Nonparametric Statistics	937
5.2. "Divide and Conquer": A Generalized Arrow's Theorem	938
5.3. Dysfunctional Societies: Lessons from Sen's Theorem	940
5.4. Applying Chichilnisky's Topological Dictator to Psychology	941
6. Summary	942
Acknowledgments	943
References	943
Index	947