

BIOETHICS

Principles, Issues, and Cases



LEWIS VAUGHN

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

Preface ix

Part I. Principles and Theories

Chapter 1

MORAL REASONING IN BIOETHICS 3

Ethics and Bioethics 3

Ethics and the Moral Life 5

In Depth: Morality and the Law 7

Moral Principles in Bioethics 8

Autonomy 9

Beneficence 10

Utility 11

Justice 12

Ethical Relativism 13

In Depth: Anthropology and Moral

Diversity 14

Ethics and Religion 17

Moral Arguments 18

Argument Fundamentals 19

Patterns of Moral Arguments 22

Review: Valid and Invalid Argument Forms 23

In Depth: Fallacies in Moral Reasoning 24

Evaluating Premises 26

Key Terms 28

Summary 28

Further Reading 29

Notes 29

Chapter 2

BIOETHICS AND MORAL THEORIES 30

The Nature of Moral Theories 30

Influential Moral Theories 31

Utilitarianism 32

In Depth: Utilitarianism and the Golden Rule 34

Kantian Ethics 34

Natural Law Theory 36

Rawls' Contract Theory 38

Virtue Ethics 39

The Ethics of Care 40

In Depth: Can Virtue Be Taught? 41

Feminist Ethics 42

Criteria for Judging Moral Theories 42

Review: Evaluating Moral Theories: Criteria of Adequacy 44

Applying the Criteria 44

Utilitarianism 45

Kant's Theory 46

Key Terms 46

Summary 47

Further Reading 47

Notes 48

Part 2. Physician and Patient

Chapter 3

PATERNALISM AND PATIENT AUTONOMY 51

Shades of Autonomy and Paternalism 51

Refusing Treatment 52

In Depth: The Hippocratic Oath 53

Futile Treatment 54

Legal Brief: Refusing Treatment for Children on Religious Grounds 55

In Depth: CPR and DNR 56

Applying Major Theories 56

Key Terms 57

Summary 57

Classic Case File: Elizabeth Bouvia 58
 Cases for Evaluation 60
 Further Reading 62
 Notes 63

READINGS 63

"Paternalism," *Gerald Dworkin* 63
 "The Refutation of Medical Paternalism,"
Alan Goldman 73
 "Why Doctors Should Intervene,"
Terrence F. Ackerman 79
 "Autonomy, Futility, and the Limits of Medicine,"
Robert L. Schwartz 84
 "Whose Body Is It Anyway?" *Atul Gawande* 88
Bouvia v. Superior Court, California Court
of Appeal 98
 "Fundamental Elements of the Patient-Physician
 Relationship," *AMA Council on Ethical and*
Judicial Affairs 102
 "Code of Ethics for Nurses," *American Nurses*
Association 103

Chapter 4

TRUTH-TELLING AND CONFIDENTIALITY 105

Paternalism and Deception 105
In Depth: Do Patients Want the Truth? Do
Physicians Tell It? 106
 Confidential Truths 108
Legal Brief: Confidentiality and a Duty
to Warn 109
 Applying Major Theories 110
 Classic Case File: *Carlos R.* 111
 Key Terms 112
 Summary 112
 Cases for Evaluation 112
 Further Reading 114
 Notes 114

READINGS 115

"Telling the Truth to Patients: A Clinical Ethics
 Exploration," *David C. Thomasma* 115

"On Telling Patients the Truth," *Mack Lipkin* 119
 "On a Supposed Right to Lie from Altruistic
 Motives," *Immanuel Kant* 121
 "Respect for Patients, Physicians, and the Truth,"
Susan Cullen and Margaret Klein 122
 "Why Privacy Is Important," *James Rachels* 130
 "Confidentiality in Medicine—A Decrepit
 Concept," *Mark Siegler* 135
Tarasoff v. Regents of the University of California,
Supreme Court of California 138

Chapter 5

INFORMED CONSENT 144

Autonomy and Consent 144
 Conditions of Informed Consent 145
In Depth: Two Views of Informed
Consent 147
Legal Brief: Important Informed Consent
Cases 148
 Applying Major Theories 149
 Key Terms 149
 Summary 149
 Classic Case File: *Jerry Canterbury* 150
 Cases for Evaluation 151
 Further Reading 153
 Notes 154

READINGS 154

"The Concept of Informed Consent,"
Ruth R. Faden and Tom L. Beauchamp 154
 "Informed Consent—Must It Remain a Fairy
 Tale?" *Jay Katz* 159
 "Transparency: Informed Consent in Primary
 Care," *Howard Brody* 169
 "Should Informed Consent Be Based on Rational
 Beliefs?" *Julian Savulescu and Richard W.*
Momeyer 175
 "Informed Consent: Some Challenges to the
 Universal Validity of the Western Model,"
Robert J. Levine 183
Canterbury v. Spence, United States Court of
Appeals 189

Chapter 6

HUMAN RESEARCH 193

The Science of Clinical Trials 194

In Depth: The Tuskegee Tragedy 195

Beneficence, Science, and Placebos 196

Science and Informed Consent 199

In Depth: Women in Clinical Trials 200

Research on the Vulnerable 201

In Depth: Why Enter a Clinical Trial? 202

Applying Major Theories 205

Key Terms 206

Summary 206

Classic Case File: The UCLA Schizophrenia

Study 207

Cases for Evaluation 208

Further Reading 212

Notes 212

READINGS 213

The Nuremberg Code 213

*Declaration of Helsinki: Ethical Principles for
Medical Research Involving Human Subjects,*

World Medical Association 214

“The Belmont Report,” *National Commission for
the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical
and Behavioral Research* 217

“Final Report: Human Radiation Experiments,”
*Advisory Committee on Human Radiation
Experiments* 220

“Of Mice but Not Men: Problems of the
Randomized Clinical Trial,” *Samuel Hellman
and Deborah S. Hellman* 226

“A Response to a Purported Ethical Difficulty with
Randomized Clinical Trials Involving Cancer
Patients,” *Benjamin Freedman* 231

“How to Resolve an Ethical Dilemma Concerning
Randomized Clinical Trials,”
Don Marquis 235

“Clinical Trials: Are They Ethical?” *Eugene
Passamani* 238

“The Ethics of Clinical Research in the Third
World,” *Marcia Angell* 242

“Ethical Issues in Clinical Trials in Developing
Countries,” *Baruch Brody* 246

Part 3. Life and Death

Chapter 7

ABORTION 253

Starting Point: The Basics 253

Fact File: U.S. Abortions 254

In Depth: Abortion and Public Opinion 256

The Legal Struggle 257

Persons and Rights 257

In Depth: Late-Term Abortion 258

Applying Major Theories 262

Key Terms 263

Summary 263

Classic Case File: Nancy Klein 264

Cases for Evaluation 265

Further Reading 268

Notes 268

READINGS 269

“A Defense of Abortion,”

Judith Jarvis Thomson 269

“Why Abortion Is Immoral,”

Don Marquis 279

“On the Moral and Legal Status of Abortion,”

Mary Anne Warren 291

“An Almost Absolute Value in History,”

John T. Noonan, Jr. 301

“Abortion Decisions: Personal Morality,”

Daniel Callahan 305

“Abortion and the Concept of a Person,”

Jane English 310

“In Defense of Abortion and Infanticide,”

Michael Tooley 316

“Abortion Through a Feminist Ethic Lens,”

Susan Sherwin 333

Roe v. Wade, United States Supreme Court 342

Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania

v. Casey, United States Supreme Court 347

Chapter 8

REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY 354

In Vitro Fertilization 354

Fact File: Assisted Reproduction 355

Surrogacy 360

*In Depth: IVF and Children's Future
Children* 361

Cloning 362

*Legal Brief: Surrogacy Contracts
and the Law* 363*In Depth: Cloning Time Line* 365

Applying Major Theories 366

Key Terms 367

Summary 367

Classic Case File: Baby M 368

Cases for Evaluation 369

Further Reading 371

Notes 372

READINGS 373"IVF: The Simple Case," *Peter Singer* 373"IVF and Women's Interests: An Analysis
of Feminist Concerns," *Mary Anne
Warren* 377"Give Me Children or I Shall Die! New
Reproductive Technologies and Harm to
Children," *Cynthia Cohen* 389"Instruction on Respect for Human Life in Its
Origin and on the Dignity of Procreation,"
*Congregation for the Doctrine of the
Faith* 400"Surrogate Mothering: Exploitation or
Empowerment?" *Laura M. Purdy* 409"On 'Surrogacy,'" *Barbara Katz Rothman* 418"The Wisdom of Repugnance,"
Leon R. Kass 426"Cloning Human Beings: An Assessment
of the Ethical Issues Pro and Con,"
Dan W. Brock 441*Opinion in the Matter of Baby M*, New Jersey
Supreme Court 452

Chapter 9

GENETIC CHOICES 460

Genes and Genomes 460

Genetic Testing 461

*In Depth: Direct-to-Consumer Genetic
Tests* 464

Gene Therapy 468

Fact File: Genetic Tests 469

Stem Cells 471

In Depth: Recent Research in Gene Therapy 472

Applying Major Theories 474

Classic Case File: The Kingsburys 475

Key Terms 476

Summary 476

Cases for Evaluation 477

Further Reading 479

Notes 479

READINGS 480"Implications of Prenatal Diagnosis for the
Human Right to Life," *Leon R. Kass* 480"Genetics and Reproductive Risk: Can Having
Children Be Immoral?" *Laura M. Purdy* 484"The Morality of Screening for Disability," *Jeff
McMahan* 491"Disowning Knowledge: Issues in Genetic
Testing," *Robert Wachbroit* 495"The Non-Identity Problem and Genetic Harms—
the Case of Wrongful Handicaps,"
Dan W. Brock 499"Is Gene Therapy a Form of Eugenics?,"
John Harris 503"Genetic Enhancement," *Walter Glannon* 509"Germ-Line Gene Therapy," *LeRoy Walters and
Julie Gage Palmer* 514"What Does 'Respect for Embryos' Mean in the
Context of Stem Cell Research?"
Bonnie Steinbock 521"Declaration on the Production and the Scientific
and Therapeutic Use of Human Embryonic
Stem Cells," *Pontifical Academy for Life* 524

Chapter 10

EUTHANASIA AND PHYSICIAN-ASSISTED SUICIDE 526

Deciding Life and Death 527

Legal Brief: Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide: Major Developments 529

In Depth: Euthanasia and Assisted Suicide: What Doctors Think and Do 530

Autonomy, Mercy, and Harm 530

In Depth: Oregon's Death With Dignity Act 533

Applying Major Theories 534

In Depth: Physician-Assisted Suicide and Public Opinion 535

Key Terms 536

Summary 536

Classic Case File: Nancy Cruzan 537

Cases for Evaluation 538

Further Reading 541

Notes 541

READINGS 542

"The Wrongfulness of Euthanasia,"

J. Gay-Williams 542

"Voluntary Active Euthanasia,"

Dan W. Brock 545

"When Self-Determination Runs Amok,"

Daniel Callahan 556

"When Abstract Moralizing Runs Amok,"

John Lachs 561

"Physician-Assisted Suicide: A Tragic View,"

John D. Arras 565

"Active and Passive Euthanasia,"

James Rachels 580

"The Distinction Between Refusing Medical

Treatment and Suicide," *New York State Task Force on Life and the Law* 584

"The Philosophers' Brief," *Ronald Dworkin,*

Thomas Nagel, Robert Nozick, John Rawls, Thomas Scanlon, and Judith Jarvis Thomson 592

Vacco v. Quill, United States Supreme Court 601
Washington v. Glucksberg, United States Supreme Court 604

Part 4. Justice and Health Care

Chapter 11

DIVIDING UP HEALTH CARE RESOURCES 613

Health Care in Trouble 613

In Depth: Unequal Health Care for Minorities 615

Fact File: U.S. Health Care 616

Theories of Justice 616

A Right to Health Care 617

In Depth: Public Opinion: Obtaining Adequate Health Care 618

The Ethics of Rationing 620

Key Terms 622

Summary 622

Classic Case File: Christine deMeurers 623

Cases for Evaluation 624

Further Reading 626

Notes 627

READINGS 627

"Is There a Right to Health Care and, if So, What Does It Encompass?" *Norman Daniels* 627

"The Right to a Decent Minimum of Health Care," *Allen E. Buchanan* 634

"Multiculturalism and Just Health Care: Taking Pluralism Seriously," *Jeffrey Blustein* 640

"Rights to Health Care, Social Justice, and Fairness in Health Care Allocations: Frustrations in the Face of Finitude," *H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr.* 652

"Rationing Fairly: Programmatic Considerations," *Norman Daniels* 661

"The Allocation of Exotic Medical Lifesaving Therapy," *Nicholas Rescher* 666

"QALYfying the Value of Life," *John Harris* 675

Glossary 683

Index 685