



THE ETHICS OF ABORTION

WOMEN'S RIGHTS,
HUMAN LIFE, AND THE
QUESTION OF JUSTICE

CHRISTOPHER
KACZOR

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
1 Introduction	1
1.1 <i>How Should We Talk About Abortion?</i>	2
1.2 <i>Loaded Language</i>	6
1.3 <i>Women and Abortion</i>	8
1.4 <i>Moral Goodness and Human Flourishing</i>	11
2 Does Personhood Begin After Birth?	13
2.1 <i>Persons vs. Human Beings</i>	14
2.1.1 <i>Not All Human Beings Are Persons</i>	15
2.1.2 <i>Potentiality Is Irrelevant</i>	16
2.2 <i>When Does Personhood Begin?</i>	17
2.3 <i>Critical Responses to Justifications of Infanticide</i>	20
2.3.1 <i>Is Species Morally Irrelevant?</i>	20
2.3.2 <i>Potentiality and the Symmetry Principle</i>	23
2.3.3 <i>Curious Exceptions to the Rule</i>	27
2.4 <i>Defining Personhood</i>	27
2.5 <i>Seriously Ill Newborns</i>	33
2.6 <i>Arbitrary Limits?</i>	35
3 Does Personhood Begin at Birth?	38
3.1 <i>Distinguishing Humans from Persons</i>	38
3.2 <i>Abortion Yes, Infanticide No</i>	40
3.3 <i>Critiquing the Conventional View</i>	42
3.4 <i>Is Personhood a Matter of Location?</i>	48
3.5 <i>What is Partial Birth Abortion?</i>	51
3.6 <i>Reconsidering Warren's Account</i>	52
4 Does Personhood Begin During Pregnancy?	56
4.1 <i>What Characteristic Grants Personhood?</i>	56

4.1.1	<i>Conscious Desires/Interests</i>	57
4.1.2	<i>Viability</i>	68
4.1.3	<i>Quickening/Fetal Movement</i>	71
4.1.4	<i>Sentience</i>	74
4.1.5	<i>Human Appearance</i>	78
4.1.6	<i>Brain Development</i>	79
4.1.7	<i>Implantation</i>	81
4.2	<i>The Developmental View</i>	83
4.3	<i>A Critique of the Developmental View</i>	85
5	Does Personhood Begin at Conception?	91
5.1	<i>Are All Human Beings Persons?</i>	91
5.1.1	<i>Personhood as Endowment or Performance?</i>	93
5.1.2	<i>Humans are Rational Animals</i>	97
5.1.3	<i>The Lessons of History</i>	102
5.2	<i>When Do Humans Begin to Exist?</i>	102
5.3	<i>The Constitutive Property Argument</i>	105
6	Does the Human Embryo Have Rights?	121
6.1	<i>The Acorn Analogy</i>	122
6.2	<i>Size</i>	125
6.3	<i>Twinning</i>	127
6.4	<i>Embryo Fusion</i>	129
6.5	<i>High Embryo-Mortality Rate</i>	131
6.6	<i>Hylomorphism</i>	133
6.7	<i>Anti-Abortion, Anti-Contraception</i>	136
6.8	<i>Living Human Cells Are Not Persons</i>	137
6.9	<i>Embryo Rescue Case</i>	139
6.10	<i>The Bag of Marbles Analogy</i>	139
6.11	<i>Cost-Benefit Analysis</i>	142
6.12	<i>The Uncertainty Argument</i>	143
7	Is it Wrong to Abort a Person?	145
7.1	<i>The Violinist Analogy</i>	145
7.2	<i>The Burglar Analogy</i>	147
7.3	<i>The "No Worse Off" Argument</i>	150
7.4	<i>Critical Analysis of the Violinist Analogy</i>	150
7.4.1	<i>The Misunderstood Samaritan</i>	150
7.4.2	<i>The Bodily Integrity Objection</i>	151
7.4.3	<i>The Consistency Objection</i>	154
7.4.4	<i>The Intention/Foresight Objection</i>	157
7.5	<i>Critical Analysis of the Burglar Analogy</i>	162
7.6	<i>Special Duties to Care for Children?</i>	165

7.7	<i>The Comparative Burdens Objection</i>	168
7.8	<i>Does Killing Make a Being "Worse Off"?</i>	176
8	Is Abortion Permissible in Hard Cases?	177
8.1	<i>Hard Cases for Critics of Abortion</i>	178
8.1.1	<i>Difficult Circumstances</i>	178
8.1.2	<i>Fetal Deformity</i>	179
8.1.3	<i>Abortion for the Child's Good</i>	181
8.1.4	<i>Cases of Rape and Incest</i>	183
8.1.5	<i>Abortion to Save the Mother's Life</i>	185
8.2	<i>Cases of Conscience</i>	191
8.3	<i>Hard Cases for Defenders of Abortion</i>	193
8.3.1	<i>Murder of Pregnant Women</i>	193
8.3.2	<i>Sex Selection Abortion</i>	194
8.3.3	<i>Abortion for Frivolous Reasons</i>	200
8.3.4	<i>Safe and Legal, but Why Rare?</i>	200
8.3.5	<i>Why Personal Opposition?</i>	202
8.3.6	<i>Prenatal Bonding with "Our Baby"</i>	206
8.3.7	<i>Morally Permissible vs. Morally Objectionable</i>	209
8.3.8	<i>Intermediate Moral Worth of the Human Fetus</i>	210
9	Could Artificial Wombs End the Abortion Debate?	215
9.1	<i>Artificial Wombs and Ardent Defenders of Abortion</i>	215
9.2	<i>Artificial Wombs and Ardent Critics of Abortion</i>	219
9.2.1	<i>The Artificiality Objection</i>	219
9.2.2	<i>The IVF Objection</i>	220
9.2.3	<i>The Deprivation of Maternal Shelter Objection</i>	220
9.2.4	<i>The Birth Within Marriage Objection</i>	222
9.2.5	<i>The Integrative Parenthood Objection</i>	223
9.2.6	<i>The Surrogate Motherhood Objection</i>	225
9.2.7	<i>The Wrongful Experimentation Objection</i>	226
9.2.8	<i>The Objection from the Right of a Child to Develop in the Womb of the Mother</i>	227
9.3	<i>An End to the Abortion Debate?</i>	230
	<i>Bibliography</i>	231
	<i>Index</i>	243