## **Contents**

|    | The nature and scope of this work                             | page x |
|----|---|--------|
|    | ROBERTO MANGABEIRA UNGER AND LEE SMOLIN                       |        |
| Pa | rt I Roberto Mangabeira Unger                                 | 1      |
| 1  | The science of the one universe in time                       | 5      |
|    | The singular existence of the universe                        | 5      |
|    | The inclusive reality of time                                 | 7      |
|    | The selective realism of mathematics                          | 15     |
|    | The first cosmological fallacy                                | 18     |
|    | The second cosmological fallacy                               | 23     |
|    | Causality without laws  | 32     |
| 2  | The context and consequences of the argument                  | 46     |
|    | The argument and recent physics and cosmology                 | 46     |
|    | The argument and the physics of the first half of the twentie | eth    |
|    | century   | 49     |
|    | The argument and natural history                              | 54     |
|    | The argument and social and historical study                  | 67     |
|    | Reinventing natural philosophy                                | 75     |
|    | What is at stake  | 89     |
| 3  | The singular existence of the universe                        | 100    |
|    | The conception of the singular existence of the universe      |        |
|    | introduced  | 100    |
|    | Arguments for the singular existence of the universe          | 116    |
|    | Implications for the agenda of cosmology                      | 141    |
|    | The finite and the infinite at the beginning of the universe  | 144    |
|    | The initial conditions of the history of the universe         | 147    |
|    | The unexplained constants of nature                           | 156    |

| 4  | The inclusive reality of time                               | 162 |
|----|---|-----|
|    | The problem presented: How much of nature exists in time?   | 162 |
|    | The argument in science and natural philiosophy             | 170 |
|    | Time as the transformation of transformation                | 222 |
|    | Attributes of time: non-emergent, global, irreversible, and |     |
|    | continuous  | 226 |
|    | The proto-ontological assumptions of this view of time      | 239 |
|    | The idea of the inclusive reality of time restated          | 245 |
|    | From being to becoming                                      | 249 |
| 5  | The mutability of the laws of nature                        | 259 |
|    | Changing laws   | 259 |
|    | The conundrum of the meta-laws                              | 275 |
|    | The problem of causation in the early universe revisited    | 277 |
|    | The best hope for resolving the conundrum of the meta-laws  | 280 |
|    | From speculative conception to empirical inquiry            | 288 |
|    | Implications of the inclusive reality of time for some      |     |
|    | fundamental ideas   | 292 |
| 6  | The selective realism of mathematics                        | 302 |
|    | The problem   | 302 |
|    | Mathematics as discovery and mathematics as invention       | 303 |
|    | The attributes of mathematics                               | 305 |
|    | A natural-evolutionary conjecture                           | 323 |
|    | The history of mathematics reconsidered: soaring above the  |     |
|    | world without escaping it                                   | 325 |
|    | The history of mathematics reconsidered: right and wrong in |     |
|    | Hilbert's program   | 342 |
|    | A deflationary and naturalistic view of mathematics         | 345 |
| Pa | art II Lee Smolin   | 349 |
| 1  | Cosmology in crisis   | 353 |
|    | The crisis introduced                                       | 353 |

|   | Temporal naturalism   | 361 |
|---|---|-----|
|   | Naturalism is an ethical stance                                 | 362 |
| 2 | Principles for a cosmological theory                            | 367 |
|   | The roots of relationalism                                      | 367 |
|   | The Newtonian paradigm  | 373 |
|   | The failure of the Newtonian paradigm when applied to           |     |
|   | cosmology   | 373 |
|   | The failure of the Newtonian paradigm to satisfy the principles |     |
|   | for a cosmological theory                                       | 377 |
|   | The failure of the Newtonian paradigm for elementary events     | 379 |
|   | Reductionism and its limits                                     | 379 |
|   | The uniqueness of fundamental events                            | 382 |
|   | Relationalism and its limits: relational versus intrinsic       |     |
|   | properties  | 385 |
|   | Two relational paths to general relativity: Einstein and        |     |
|   | shape dynamics  | 386 |
|   | Relational purism   | 388 |
|   | Impure relationalism: a role for intrinsic properties           | 388 |
|   | Dynamical pairings and relational versus intrinsic              |     |
|   | properties  | 389 |
|   | The Newtonian paradigm from the viewpoint of temporal           |     |
|   | naturalism  | 391 |
| 3 | The setting: the puzzles of contemporary cosmology              | 393 |
|   | The message of the data from particle physics                   | 393 |
|   | The message of the large-scale astronomical data                | 395 |
|   | What questions are imperative, given the data?                  | 399 |
|   | What features of the standard cosmological model are            |     |
|   | unconstrained by the data?                                      | 400 |
|   | What happened at very early times?                              | 401 |
|   | Brief review of the singularity theorems                        | 402 |
|   | The meaning of the singularity theorems                         | 405 |
|   | What will happen to the far future of our universe?             | 407 |

|   | What is very far away from us, outside the cosmological horizon? | 410 |
|---|--|-----|
|   | The options: plurality or succession                             | 412 |
| 4 | Hypotheses for a new cosmology                                   | 414 |
|   | The uniqueness of the universe                                   | 414 |
|   | The reality of time  | 415 |
|   | Does a real time conflict with the relativity of simultaneity?   | 418 |
| 5 | Mathematics  | 422 |
|   | A new conception: mathematics as evoked reality                  | 422 |
|   | The reasonable effectiveness of mathematics in physics           | 428 |
|   | The unreasonable effectiveness of mathematics in mathematics     | 430 |
|   | The stages of development of mathematics                         | 431 |
|   | Why is mathematics effective in physics?                         | 445 |
| 6 | Approaches to solving the meta-law dilemma                       | 447 |
|   | Three options for global structure of the larger universe        | 449 |
|   | Prospects for a solution of the landscape problem in the three   |     |
|   | scenarios  | 451 |
|   | Linear cyclic models   | 452 |
|   | Branching models   | 453 |
|   | Branching cyclic cosmologies                                     | 454 |
|   | Cosmological natural selection                                   | 454 |
|   | Pluralistic cosmological scenarios                               | 460 |
|   | Principle of precedence  | 465 |
|   | Universality of meta-law: reducing the choice of laws to choices |     |
|   | of initial conditions  | 470 |
|   | The unification of law and state                                 | 476 |
| 7 | Implications of temporal naturalism for the philosophy of        |     |
|   | mind   | 480 |
|   | Two speculative proposals regarding qualia                       | 482 |
| 8 | An agenda for science  | 484 |
|   | The agenda for observational cosmology                           | 484 |
|   | Can the laws of nature be observed to change?                    | 485 |

## CONTENTS IX

| The agenda for quantum foundations                           | 486 |
|--|-----|
| The existence of a preferred global time                     | 491 |
| The agenda for explaining the arrows of time                 | 492 |
| The agenda for quantum gravity                               | 496 |
| The main challenge: resolving the meta-laws and cosmological |     |
| dilemmas   | 498 |
| Concluding remarks   | 500 |
| Acknowledgments  | 502 |
| References   | 503 |
|  |     |
| A note concerning disagreements between our views            | 512 |
| ROBERTO MANGABEIRA UNGER AND LEE SMOLIN                      |     |
| Index  | 533 |