

# Natural Hazard Mitigation

RECASTING DISASTER POLICY AND PLANNING



David R. Godschalk, Timothy Beatley, Philip Berke,  
David J. Brower, and Edward J. Kaiser

# Contents

List of Figures and Tables xi  
Preface xv

## **Part I**

### ***Coping with Floods, Earthquakes, and Hurricanes: U.S. Hazard Mitigation Policy***

1. Mitigating Natural Hazards: A National Challenge 3  
Importance of Natural Hazard Mitigation 4 • Box 1.1. Record Natural Disasters of the 1990s 6 • Natural Hazard Mitigation Policy Framework 10 • Box 1.2. The National Mitigation Strategy: Partnerships for Building Safer Communities 12 • Assessing the Effectiveness of Hazard Mitigation 17 • Structure of the Book 22 • Notes 23 • References 23
2. Evolving Mitigation Policy Directions 27  
History and Evolution of Mitigation and Disaster Assistance Policy 27 • Critically Assessing the Current Framework 38 • Recent Legislative and Policy Development Activity 54 • Major Trends in Mitigation Policy: Common Themes in the Debate 65 • Conclusions 79 • Notes 79 • References 81

## **Part II**

### ***Mitigation in Action: Six Disaster Cases***

3. Florida After Hurricane Andrew 103  
The Hurricane Event 103 • Damage Costs from Andrew 104 • A Vulnerable South Florida 106 • The Pre-Andrew Planning and Mitigation Framework 109 • Response and Recovery from the Storm 114 • Mitigation Activities and Opportunities 115 • Key Policy Issues Emerging After the Storm 131 • Recent Initiatives and Future Directions in Florida 147 • Conclusions and Recommendations 151 • Florida Update 154 • Note 157 • References 157 • Persons Interviewed 159

4. Missouri After the Midwest Floods of 1993 161
  - The Disaster Events 161 • Missouri's 1994 Section 409 Plan 163 • Missouri's Hazard Mitigation Planning and Implementation Process 165 • Results 169 • Conclusions and Recommendations 180 • 1997 Update 190 • Notes 191 • References 192 • Persons Interviewed 192
5. Iowa After the Midwest Floods of 1993 193
  - The Disaster Events 193 • Iowa's Section 409 Plan 194 • Iowa's Hazard Mitigation Planning and Implementation Process 196 • Results 204 • Conclusions and Recommendations 214 • 1997 Update 225 • Acknowledgments 227 • Note 227 • References 227 • Persons Interviewed 228
6. California After the Loma Prieta and Northridge Earthquakes 231
  - Two Earthquake Disasters 231 • California's Section 409 Plan 236 • California's Earthquake Mitigation Planning and Implementation Process 239 • Influences on Recovery and Mitigation 246 • Results 259 • Issues 267 • Conclusions and Recommendations 270 • Acknowledgments 273 • Note 273 • References 273 • Persons Interviewed 274
7. Massachusetts After Hurricane Bob and Other Storms 277
  - The Disaster Events 277 • Massachusetts's 1993 Section 409 Plan 279 • Massachusetts's Hazard Mitigation Planning and Implementation Process 281 • Results 288 • Conclusions and Recommendations 291 • Note 295 • References 296 • Persons Interviewed 296
8. Tennessee After a Series of Floods and Storms 299
  - The Disaster Events 299 • Tennessee's 1994 Section 409 Plan 300 • Tennessee's Hazard Mitigation Planning and Implementation Process 301 • Results 307 • Conclusions and Recommendations 313 • 1997 Update 318 • Note 320 • References 320 • Persons Interviewed 320

### **Part III**

## ***Assessing the National Mitigation System***

9. State Hazard Mitigation Plans: Falling Short of Their Potential 327
  - Collecting and Evaluating the Plans: Study Methodology 328 • Question One: Are the Requirements of the Stafford Act Being Met? 332 • Question Two: What Are the Strengths and Weaknesses of the Plans? 337 • Summary of Problems with Most State Hazard Mitigation Plans 363 • Recommendations for Making Better State Hazard Mitigation Plans 365 • Note 369 • References 369 • Appendix 9.A: Section 409 Plan Collection 370 • Appendix 9.B: Guide for Describing and Evaluating Section 409 Plans 373

## 10. The Hazard Mitigation Grant Program: Scattered Spending 393

The Hazard Mitigation Grant Program (HMGP) 393 • Building a Hazard Mitigation Grant Program Funding Database 394 • Section 404 Program Expenditure Patterns, 1988–1995 395 • Policy Implications 425 • Reinventing the Hazard Mitigation Grant Program 431 • References 434 • Appendix 10.A: Summary of HMGP Applications and Funding for All Declared Disasters by Disaster Type, 11/24/88–4/21/95 (FEMA-818-DR-NC—FEMA-1047-DR-AL) 435 • Appendix 10.B: Hazard Mitigation Grant Program Project Categories and Subcategories 448 • Notes 434

## 11. State Implementation of Natural Disaster Mitigation Policy: A Flawed System 453

The Stafford Act Framework 454 • Conceptual Framework of an Intergovernmental System for Mitigation Planning 455 • Assessing Linkages: Analytic Methods 457 • Findings 460 • Implications for Reforming Natural Disaster Mitigation Policy 472 • Notes 473 • References 474

## ***Part IV***

### ***Recasting the National Mitigation System***

## 12. Ethical Guidelines for Hazard Mitigation 479

Understanding Mitigation Ethics 479 • Ethical Roles and Responsibilities 480 • Competing Values in Mitigation 495 • Fairness in Mitigation 506 • Ethical Aspects of Mitigation Analyses 514 • Guidelines for Ethical Mitigation 516 • Notes 522 • References 523

## 13. Natural Hazard Mitigation: Planning for Sustainable Communities 525

Sustainable Communities: The New Vision for Natural Hazard Mitigation 525 • Breaking Through to Sustainability: Summary of Recommendations 528 • Reforming the Intergovernmental Mitigation System 528 • Reforming Mitigation Policy 536 • Reforming Mitigation Practice 544 • Conclusion: Creating a Supportive Climate for Mitigation 549 • Postscript 550 • References 551

About the Authors 553

Index 557