

# Issues in Medical Law and Ethics



Derek Morgan

# CONTENTS

---

|                             |     |
|-----------------------------|-----|
| <i>Preface</i>              | v   |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>      | ix  |
| <i>Table of Cases</i>       | xv  |
| <i>Table of Legislation</i> | xix |

## PART I MEDICAL LAW, TRAGIC CHOICES AND THE RISK SOCIETY

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>1 WHAT IS MEDICAL LAW?</b>  | <b>3</b>  |
| MEDICAL LAW: UNPLUGGED   | 3         |
| THE VOCABULARY OF MEDICAL JURISPRUDENCE                                | 7         |
| 'Treat me gentle'  | 7         |
| Constituting medical law   | 9         |
| <b>2 MEDICAL LAW AND THE LAND OF<br/>METAMORPHOSES</b>                 | <b>13</b> |
| METAMORPHOSIS 1: SCIENTIFIC MEDICINE                                   | 13        |
| METAMORPHOSIS 2: EPISTEMOLOGY AND ETHICS                               | 18        |
| METAMORPHOSIS 3: THE NATURE OF THE PATIENT                             | 20        |
| METAMORPHOSIS 4: THE CHANGING CONSTITUTION                             | 24        |
| The knowledge economy and the social investment State                  | 25        |
| Holistic government and problem solving                                | 26        |
| The Europeanisation of constitutional law and<br>globalisation of law  | 27        |
| Globalisation  | 29        |
| METAMORPHOSIS 5: THE NATURE OF LAW'S RESPONSES                         | 32        |
| <b>3 BIOMEDICAL DIPLOMACY: TRAGIC CHOICES<br/>AND THE RISK SOCIETY</b> | <b>37</b> |

## PART II SOME LANGUAGE QUESTIONS

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <b>4 HEALTH RIGHTS, ETHICS AND JUSTICE:<br/>THE OPPORTUNITY COSTS OF RHETORIC<br/>ALLOCATION</b> | <b>47</b> |
| RIGHTS   | 48        |
|  | 50        |

|  |   |            |
|--|---|------------|
|  | RIGHTS TO HEALTH CARE?  | 53         |
|  | RIGHTS TO HEALTH CARE AND THE OPPORTUNITY<br>COSTS OF RHETORIC                      | 54         |
|  | OF MARKETS AND MORALS   | 60         |
| <b>5</b>   | <b>FEMINISMS' ACCOUNTS OF<br/>REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY</b>                           | <b>63</b>  |
|  | THE CONCERNS OF REPRODUCTION  | 63         |
|  | FEMINISMS' RESPONSES TO REPRODUCTION<br>AND REGULATION                              | 68         |
|  | THE BIOMEDICAL MODEL  | 69         |
|  | The critics   | 70         |
|  | The Contextualists: '... no daughters to comfort her and<br>no sons to support her' | 71         |
|  | REPRODUCTIVE 'CHOICE'   | 75         |
|  | METAMORPHOSES: ETHICS, HEALTH AND FAMILY  | 76         |
| <b>6</b>   | <b>WHERE DO I OWN MY BODY? (AND WHY?)</b>   | <b>83</b>  |
|  | INTRODUCTION  | 83         |
|  | OWNERSHIP AND AUTONOMY  | 83         |
|  | Ownership   | 84         |
|  | On autonomy   | 87         |
|  | Who owns?   | 90         |
|  | ENGLISH COMMON LAW  | 92         |
|  | BODY SHOPPING   | 97         |
|  | Why do these questions appear now?  | 97         |
|  | CONCLUDING REMARKS: SHOPPING THE BODY   | 103        |
| <br><b>PART III</b><br><b>INTROS: ENTRANCES AND ARRIVALS</b> |   |            |
| <b>7</b>   | <b>THE LEGAL STATUS OF THE EMBRYO AND THE FETUS</b>                                 | <b>107</b> |
|  | EARLY ATTITUDES TO THE FETUS  | 107        |
|  | Legal conundrums and philosophical excursus   | 109        |
|  | The classical common law position   | 114        |
|  | THE HUMAN FERTILISATION AND EMBRYOLOGY<br>ACT 1990                                  | 118        |
|  | General prohibitions  | 119        |
|  | Human embryo research   | 120        |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| THE CONSENT REQUIREMENTS OF THE ACT  | 121        |
| Posthumous treatments  | 123        |
| CIVIL LIABILITY: CONGENITAL DISABILITY   | 124        |
| CONCLUSION   | 126        |
| <b>8 LEGAL AND ETHICAL DILEMMAS OF FETAL SEX IDENTIFICATION AND GENDER SELECTION</b>   | <b>129</b> |
| DIAGNOSTIC ISSUES  | 129        |
| HOW CAN SEX BE DETERMINED?   | 131        |
| What might selection be used for?  | 133        |
| PRENATAL SCREENING, PRENATAL DIAGNOSIS AND GENETIC INFORMATION                         | 134        |
| Screening for congenital malformations   | 134        |
| Screening for chromosomal abnormalities  | 135        |
| Screening for inherited diseases   | 135        |
| The search for the perfect baby?   | 136        |
| FETAL SEX IDENTIFICATION, ABORTION AND THE LAW   | 144        |
| How prevalent is sex selection?  | 144        |
| The mania for sons   | 146        |
| What is the ambit of the Abortion Act 1967?  | 147        |
| REPRODUCTIVE ETHICS: THE SEARCH FOR THE PERFECT SOCIETY?                               | 149        |
| <b>PART IV</b>   |            |
| <b>ATTEMPTS AND FAILURES IN MEDICAL LAW:<br/>THE CASE OF GENETICS AND RISK SOCIETY</b> |            |
| <b>9 THE TROUBLED HELIX: LEGAL ASPECTS OF THE NEW GENETICS</b>                         | <b>155</b> |
| EPISTEMOLOGY, ETHICS AND GENETICS  | 155        |
| GENETIC INFORMATION AND PRIVACY  | 159        |
| Medical confidentiality and the public interest  | 166        |
| Genetics and existence: the abortion section   | 168        |
| Children and consent   | 173        |
| CONCLUSION   | 177        |

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>10 AFTER GENETICS</b>  | <b>179</b> |
| GENETICS: THE REGULATORY QUADRILLE  | 180        |
| (a) Identity issues: the strange case of nucleus substitution             | 187        |
| (b) The legality of taking and storing ovarian tissue<br>and gametes      | 194        |
| LAW, SCIENCE AND PUBLIC POLICY  | 199        |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>PART V</b>   |            |
| <b>OUTROS: EXITS AND DEPARTURES</b>                                       |            |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>11 TRAGIC CHOICES AND MODERN DEATH:<br/>SOME BLAND REFLECTIONS</b>     | <b>203</b> |
| ON RITES  | 203        |
| ON RIGHTS   | 209        |
| LAST RIGHTS   | 210        |
| THE CASE OF TONY BLAND  | 217        |
| NEGOTIATING DEATH AND TRAGIC CHOICES                                      | 219        |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>12 ODYSSEUS AND THE BINDING DIRECTIVE:<br/>ONLY A CAUTIONARY TALE?</b> | <b>223</b> |
| ODYSSEUS AND AUTONOMY   | 223        |
| THE EXPERIENCE OF DYING AND THE<br>'VULGARISATION OF SURGERY'             | 225        |
| TERMINAL CONSIDERATIONS   | 228        |
| A LONG EXPERIENCE OF DYING AND THE<br>DEVELOPMENT OF LIVING WILLS         | 231        |
| (a) The US  | 231        |
| (b) Advance directives and English law                                    | 234        |
| A FRAIL REFLECTION?   | 248        |
| Competent choices   | 249        |
| The identity question   | 251        |
| Identity and interpretation   | 253        |
| Directing what; advancing where?  | 254        |
| WHO WANTS TO DIE FOREVER?   | 256        |
| <br>  |            |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>   | <b>259</b> |
| <br>  |            |
| <i>Index</i>  | <b>275</b> |