



**Estimating  
the  
Public Health  
Benefits  
of  
Proposed  
Air Pollution  
Regulations**

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL  
OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES

# Contents

<b>Summary</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b> .....	<b>17</b>
The Charge to the Committee, 18	
The Committee's Approach, 18	
Regulatory Context, 19	
Critical Steps of a Health Benefits Analysis, 21	
Guidance, 23	
Organization of Report, 31	
References, 32	
<b>2 Health Benefits Analyses: EPA Case Studies</b> .....	<b>34</b>
Particulate Matter and Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards, 34	
Tier 2 Motor Vehicle Emissions Standards and Gasoline Sulfur Control Requirements, 42	
Heavy Duty Engine and Vehicle Standards and Highway Diesel Fuel Sulfur Control Requirements, 45	
Prospective Analysis of the 1990 Clean Air Act Amendments, 49	
References, 54	

## CONTENTS

<b>3</b>	<b>Framing the Analysis</b> .....	<b>57</b>
	Regulatory Options Evaluated, 57	
	Selection of Effects to Evaluate, 60	
	Time Frame for the Analysis, 62	
	Description of Conditions with and without the Regulation, 64	
	Conclusions, 71	
	Recommendations, 72	
	References, 73	
<b>4</b>	<b>Exposure and Response</b> .....	<b>75</b>
	Exposure Assessment, 75	
	Health Outcomes, 84	
	Concentration-Response Functions, 93	
	Conclusions, 115	
	Recommendations, 116	
	References, 118	
<b>5</b>	<b>Uncertainty</b> .....	<b>126</b>
	EPA's Approach to Uncertainty Analysis, 127	
	Critique of EPA's Current Uncertainty Assessments, 133	
	Examples of Uncertainty Assessments, 138	
	Recommended Approach to Uncertainty Assessment, 141	
	Conclusions, 146	
	Recommendations, 146	
	References, 148	
<b>6</b>	<b>Using, Presenting, and Reviewing Health Benefits</b>	
	Analyses .....	<b>153</b>
	Compatibility of Health Benefits Analyses with Cost-Benefit	
	Analyses, 154	
	Compatibility of Health Benefits Analyses with Cost-	
	Effectiveness Analyses, 156	
	Compatibility of Health Benefits Analyses with Cost	
	Analyses, 157	
	Communication of Methods and Results of Analysis, 158	
	Quality Assurance and Quality Control, 163	

## *CONTENTS*

Conclusions, 164	
Recommendations, 164	
References, 165	
<b>Appendix</b> Biographical Information on the Committee on Estimating the Health-Risk-Reduction Benefits of Proposed Air Pollution Regulations . . . . .	166